Manual

OVERSIGHT FUNCTION OF PARLIAMENTARY COMMITTEES

Prishtina, June 2012
Manual

OVERSIGHT FUNCTION OF PARLIAMENTARY COMMITTEES

Prishtina, June 2012
First edition

Working group members:

Xheladin Hoxha  
*Head of Division for Committee Support*

Fatiq Qorri  
*Committee Clerk*

Armend Ademaj  
*Committee Clerk*

Shaip Goxhuli  
*Committee Field Officer*

Agron Demi  
*NDI external expert*

Rinor Beka  
*NDI Program Manager*

Shefki Kastrati  
*NDI Program Officer*

*Publication of this manual is facilitated by the United States Agency for International Development (USAID) and the National Democratic Institute (NDI)*
TABLE OF CONTENTS:

1. INTRODUCTION...........................................................................................................................5

2. THE OVERSIGHT FUNCTION OF THE PARLIAMENT.................................................................7
   2.1. The role of committees........................................................................................................8
   2.2. Legal basis for committee oversight..................................................................................8

3. PLANNING PROCESS FOR OVERSIGHT ACTIVITIES.............................................................12
   3.1. Annual work plan of the Committee....................................................................................12
   3.2. Determining oversight activities.......................................................................................13
   3.3. Establishment of the working group for oversight activities............................................13
   3.4. Drafting the action plan for oversight activities.................................................................14

4. IMPLEMENTATION OF THE ACTION PLAN...........................................................................16
   4.1. Identifying key aspects of the oversight activity.................................................................16
   4.2. Field visits........................................................................................................................16
   4.3. Oversight hearings............................................................................................................17
   4.4. Engaging civil society organizations and independent experts.......................................18
   4.5. Transparency of oversight activities.................................................................................18

5. OVERSIGHT OF IMPLEMENTATION OF LAWS..................................................................19
   5.1. Annual report of ministries on implementation of laws.....................................................19
   5.2. Obligations of the Committee towards the Assembly.....................................................20
   5.3. The process of overseeing the implementation of laws......................................................21

6. OVERSIGHT OF THE STATE BUDGET..................................................................................30
   6.1. The law on the budget of the Republic of Kosovo...............................................................30
   6.2. Reporting of budgetary organizations in the Assembly.....................................................32
   6.3. Oversight of implementation of the budget by committees..............................................33
   6.4. Oversight of implementation of government strategies..................................................36
   6.5. The Assembly’s role in overseeing Government actions in addressing EU Progress Report findings........................................................................................................37

7. OVERSIGHT OF INDEPENDENT INSTITUTIONS....................................................................39
   7.1. Responsibilities of the Assembly towards independent institutions...................................40
   7.2. Approval of the budget for independent institutions..........................................................40
   7.3. Appointment of heads of institutions and board members...............................................41
   7.4. Responsibilities of independent institutions towards the Assembly..................................42

4. ANNEXES:....................................................................................................................................45
   1. Standard form of the action plan for the oversight of the implementation of laws..............47
   2. Standard form for identification of obligations that the law foresees for the implementers..........................................................................................................................51
   3. Standard form for assessment of compliance of secondary legislation............................52
   4. Standard form of essential questions that need to be taken into account during oversight visits...53
5. Standard form of the final oversight report ........................................................... 54
6. The list of all independent institutions ................................................................. 57
7. Deadlines and obligations of the Government and the Assembly in the budget process ......................................................................................................................... 69
8. Strategies and Action Plans adopted during the years, the applicability of which includes 2012 and following years ................................................................. 72
1. INTRODUCTION

The manual on the “Oversight Function of the Parliamentary Committees” is part of the series of manuals developed by the Assembly of Kosovo with the purpose of supporting the work of the committee members and staff. This manual is based on the legal documents that regulate parliamentary oversight, such as the Constitution of the Republic of Kosovo, the Assembly Rules of Procedure, and the Law on the Rights and Responsibilities of Members of the Assembly of Kosovo. This manual will facilitate the practical implementation of oversight norms that are required with legal acts and best parliamentary practices.

In addition, this manual is viewed as a document that unifies the best practices established and implemented by the Assembly of Kosovo over the past 12 years. In terms of legal basis, the manual is primarily based on Article 65, paragraph 9 of the Constitution of the Republic of Kosovo, which states that the Assembly of Kosovo oversees the work of the Government and other public institutions, who are obliged to report to the Assembly about its work.

Further, this manual provides a practical interpretation of Article 73 of the Assembly of Kosovo Rules of Procedure, which outlines the oversight function of parliamentary committees.

While the Constitution and the Assembly Rules of Procedure envisage the right of committees to conduct oversight, in practice there are various ways on how an initiative for parliamentary oversight can be conducted successfully. Over the years, parliamentary committees have undertaken many parliamentary oversight initiatives and at the same time have drafted various action plans on how to complete this task successfully.

Therefore, this manual prepared by the staff of the Division for the Support of Parliamentary Committees and representatives from the National Democratic Institute (NDI) aims to establish a unified practice for the committee oversight procedures, which will make the work of members and staff more efficient, but at the same time it will help civil society organization to understand oversight processes in the Assembly. As such, the manual is only focused on oversight mechanisms and activities at the committee level.

The Legal Department will continue to prepare similar manuals for other aspects of the work of the parliamentary committees, aiming at increasing the efficiency of these bodies that carry the heaviest burden of the work in the Assembly.
I would like to take the opportunity to thank members of the working group for their dedication and commitment and express our gratitude to both NDI and USAID for supporting the development and publication of the manual.

Daut Beqiri
Director of Legal Department
Assembly of the Republic of Kosovo
2. OVERSIGHT FUNCTION OF THE PARLIAMENT

In most countries, the parliament is constitutionally mandated as the institution through which governments are held to account to the electorate. Executive oversight is the monitoring of Government activities for efficiency, probity and transparency to ensure that funds appropriated are used legally, effectively, and for the purpose for which such were intended.

Overseeing the executive branch and holding it to account is one of the prime responsibilities of the legislature, parallel with lawmakering and representation. Probably the most important role of a modern parliament is to ensure that the executive is kept under scrutiny and prevented from abusing its power. In a representative democracy, this means that the executive shall be ultimately accountable to the legislature.

In the case of parliamentary systems of government, where the life of the government is contingent on the continued support of the legislature, it shall be a minimum requirement that government is ultimately responsible to the legislature, either collectively or individually. The majority of scholars and politicians agree that effective oversight is good for the proper functioning of a democratic political system.

The government is the equivalent of the management of a country. It makes important decisions about foreign policy, education or health issues. However, most of these decisions should have approval of the parliament. The government can decide on many important issues without consulting parliament, but if parliament decides that a particular government policy is against the public interest, then it can force the government to change its policies. A proposal might then be altered, or perhaps withdrawn altogether.

The lack of efficient parliamentary oversight is often seen as a cause of failure to develop and strengthen new democracies. The purpose of the parliamentary oversight is to:

- Oversight of executive institutions, including independent institutions
- Oversight of implementation of laws, and recommendations for undertaking measures needed for ensuring proper implementation
- Keep the Government accountable for budgetary spending and ensure an increase in the efficiency and effectiveness of government actions;
- Ensure that policies proclaimed by the government and supported by the Assembly are being implemented;
- Promote accountability and transparency, as a way to increase the trust of the people in the state institutions
2.1. The role of Committees

The majority of activities of the Assembly are conducted at the committee level. A parliamentary committee is comprised of members representing all parliamentary groups. Committees are considered authorities on matters within their jurisdiction and are primarily responsible for reviewing and amending draft laws that fall in their scope of activities, overseeing of the implementation of laws, overseeing of the work of the government ministries and independent agencies, organizing public hearings, and reviewing and approving strategic documents.

Committees play the central role in exercising the oversight function by the Assembly. Each committee should ensure that the ministries, operating within their scope of responsibilities, are transparent and constantly accountable to the Assembly on the implementation of policies and government programs, legislation, and above all, management of public finances. In order to efficiently carry out the oversight function, committees have developed various tools and procedures such as:

- Organizing oversight hearings with representatives from the executive, civil society organizations, media, independent experts, citizens.
- Conducting field visits in order to closely observe the situation and gather data on matters being overseen by the committee;
- Coordinating with other independent oversight institutions such as the Auditor General, Ombudsperson, civil society organizations.

It is important to note that in conducting the oversight activities, members are primarily supported by the committee staff. In this regard, committees also need the support of other specialized units of the Assembly, such as the Research Division and the Division for Budget Analysis. The expertise and experience of civil society organizations, think tanks, and individual experts are helpful for both members and staff when conducting oversight activities.

2.2. Legal basis for committee oversight

The Constitution and the Rules of Procedures of the Assembly provide the legal basis for the oversight function of parliamentary committees. These two key documents provide a set of mechanisms that allow committees to efficiently carry out their oversight role. Based on the Rules of Procedures committees have the right to request written information from the government but also to summon ministers to submit their testimony on matters under consideration by the committees. In addition, each committee has a number of subcommittees to focus on oversight of specific issues within the committee’s broader jurisdiction.
The Rules of Procedures outline that the Budget and Finance Committee has a leading role in reviewing and overseeing the annual state budget, but also other committees may also conduct ongoing oversight of budget execution and policy implementation for their line ministries. In order to control central government finances and compliance with the annual budget, the Assembly also has established a permanent Public Accounts Committee, whose reports are a useful resource for standing committees when conducting budget oversight of line ministries. Further, the Assembly may also establish investigative committees, to conduct parliamentary investigation for matter of public interests.

In terms of oversight, the Assembly Committees also have authority to monitor the implementation of laws. They can “perform controls and studies of the effectiveness of the laws in force on issues within the scope of their authority, their implementation, and make recommendations for measures to be taken in concrete situations,” but also “exercise control over the overall activity of relevant ministries.” Further, article 73 of the Rules of Procedures stipulates that the ministries shall report to the relevant functional committee at least once a year.

### Rules of Procedure of the Assembly of Kosovo.

#### Article 73

**Authority of the committees in monitoring the implementation of laws**

1. Each Committee shall, within the scope of its authority, be authorized to monitor the implementation of a law by the government of Kosovo or ministry, respectively.

2. The relevant ministry shall report to the functional committee about the implementation of the law without request, at least once in every year.

3. In order to fulfill the authority given above, the committees shall:
   a) perform controls and studies of the effectiveness of the laws in force on issues within the scope of their authority, their implementation, and propose measures to be taken in concrete situations;
   b) produce a list containing: the date of the promulgation of the law, the date of its publication in the Official Gazette, the list of the provisions of the law that need to be implemented by the Government, the list of the government’s decisions implementing those provisions.
   c) exercise control over the overall activity of relevant ministries; and
   d) report in writing and orally once a year to the plenary sessions of the Assembly.

4. If the Ministry fails to report or if its reporting is deemed incomplete, upon the request of the committee, the issue shall be put to the agenda of the next plenary session.
Oversight hearings are an important tool, outlined in the Rules of Procedures which can be used by committees when conducting oversight. Officials of line ministries and other government agencies are summon before a parliamentary committee to account for the activities. Such hearings benefit the committee by providing background information which assists members in making sound legislative and fiscal judgments; identifying program areas within each committee’s jurisdiction that may be vulnerable to waste, fraud, abuse, mismanagement; and to determine whether new laws are needed or whether improvements in implementation of existing laws will be sufficient to resolve problems.

During oversight hearings, ministers are typically summoned to provide explanations and information as requested by the committee and answer to the questions submitted by committee members. These hearings are usually open to the media and civil society representatives but can also be closed on certain occasions. Beside government institutions, committees can invite the leaders of independent institutions that report to the Assembly. Articles 66 and 73 of the Rules of Procedures provide the legal basis for organization of oversight hearings.

Rules of Procedure of the Assembly of Kosovo,
Article 66

Committee Hearings

1. For the purpose of obtaining information on a subject under debate, a committee may hold public hearings of experts, public organizations, representatives of interests groups and other persons.

2. The committee may enter into the general discussion with the persons furnishing information insofar as this is necessary to clarify the facts.

The Rules of Procedures also recognize the authority of committees to oversee the work of independent agencies established by the Assembly. Article 72 specifically describes the procedures for handing reports of these institutions in the Assembly.
Rules of Procedure of the Assembly of Kosovo

Article 72

Special procedures regarding the reports of independent bodies

1. The annual work report of an independent body, established by the Assembly shall be reviewed by the functional committee that covers the scope of responsibilities of the independent body.

2. The committee shall review the annual report of the independent body and present to the Assembly a report with recommendations within three working weeks from the day of its receipt.

3. The review of the annual report in the Assembly meeting shall commence with a presentation of the report by the rapporteur of the functional committee. After the presentation of the report, discussion shall take place in the following order: representatives of parliamentary groups and members of the Assembly, to be concluded by a voting on the approval.

4. Notwithstanding the item 3 of this Article, the floor may be given also to the responsible person of the independent body, upon the request of the Assembly.

Committees have made significant progress in strengthening and advancing oversight mechanisms. Currently, all committees have outlined their oversight activities in the annual work plans. Though overloaded with reviewing and amending a great number of draft laws, committees regularly conduct the following oversight actions:

- Oversight of the implementation of laws
- Review and oversight of the implementation of the budget by line ministries
- Oversight of the implementation of government policies, programs’ plans, and strategies under their scope of authority
- Regular oversight of independent agencies under their scope of authority
3. PLANNING PROCESS FOR OVERSIGHT ACTIVITIES

Considering the workload and dynamics of the work, it is very important for committees to plan their oversight activities at the beginning of the year. Systematic planning of oversight activities by committee allow members and staff to be prepared and effective, to avoid planning in ad hoc basis, and most importantly to allow for effective inclusion of other stakeholders in the process, such as independent experts of civil society organizations. It is important to note however, that oversight is an ongoing process and cannot be limited only to specific activities outlined in the work plan. Committees should leave room for ongoing oversight of implementation of policies, programs, laws and budgets of ministries and independent institutions.

3.1. Annual work plan of the Committee

Development of an annual work plan at the beginning of the year is already an established practice in the work of parliamentary committees. Committee work plans are primarily based on the Annual Legislative Programme of the Government of Kosovo. Based on the Rules of Procedure of the Government of Kosovo, in December of each year the Government is required to approve the Legislative Programme, which contains the list of all draft laws, ministries responsible for drafting them, and dates by which the draft laws are expected to be received in the Government. Committees initiate the process of drafting the work plans by listing in their annual work plan the draft laws that fall in their scope of authority that need to be reviewed, amended, and forwarded for the second reading.

Apart from the listing of draft laws to be reviewed, the annual work plan includes oversight activities such as monitoring the implementation of laws, overseeing the implementation of certain policies, overseeing the implementation of strategies or action plans, and overseeing specific activities and budget execution of ministries, certain governmental departments, public enterprises, independent agencies or regulators. The oversight activities of the committee outlined in the annual work plan also provides timelines, which allows the committee to better manage its schedule.

The finalized annual plans of all committees are included in the Annual Work Programme of the Assembly of Kosovo. The Annual Work Programme of the Assembly of Kosovo is a document that contains the list of all the draft laws that are expected to be sent by the Government to the Assembly and contains the estimated dates for the first and second reading of the draft laws. The Annual Work Programme of the Assembly
also contains the timelines when the rapporteurs of the committees will submit the final oversight report, which contains the conclusions and recommendations that derive from the oversight activity and which should be approved by the Assembly.

3.2. Determining oversight activities

Committees decide internally about policies, strategic documents, action plans, and institutions that they will oversee over the course of each year. There are a number of laws, strategic documents, and action plans that need to be implemented by state institutions that fall under a committee’s scope of authority. When determining which oversight activities to include in the annual work plan, the committee needs to give priority to the laws that have entered into force in some earlier stage and the implementation of laws which have not been overseen yet. Oversight of agencies and regulators facing difficulties in their work should be given priority, particularly if various reports reveal violation of legislation and poor management.

3.3. Establishment of the working groups for oversight activities

During the course of a year, parliamentary committees conduct many activities such as reviewing draft laws, organizing public hearings, arranging study visits both domestically and abroad, reviewing the reports of governmental and independent institutions, hosting international delegations or citizens’ representatives. Therefore, in order to manage the workload more efficiently, committees establish sub-committees or working groups for handling certain issues. The working groups may be established with the aim of reviewing a draft law or overseeing implementation of laws or a government policy.

Committees of the Assembly have between 9 to 12 members, reflecting the composition of the Assembly by political party representation. Often committees conduct more than one oversight activity, therefore members are split in working groups. The committee usually decides on a group of 3-5 deputies to comprise the working group for oversight of a law, policy or institution. The working group should be comprised of members from governing and opposition parties. The composition of the working group is defined largely based on the issue that is being overseen and the background and interest of members.

For example a committee working group responsible for the oversight of the Strategy and Action Plan for Integration of Roma, Ashkali, and Egyptian Communities in the Republic of Kosovo 2009-2015 should include at least one member that represents each of these ethnic groups. Another example the working group for overseeing the implementation
of the Law on Gender Equality should include a number of women members; the oversight of a strategic document for youth, such as the Strategy for the Employment and Empowerment of Youth, should include members that are young in age. The establishment of oversight working groups needs to be formalized by vote, thus ensuring the support of the majority of members present during the committee meeting. The working group is authorized to oversee a specific matter on behalf of the committee and is obliged to submit a written report within a certain timeframe.

3.4. Drafting the action plan for oversight activities

The oversight working group, authorized by the committee, selects from among its members the chair of the group. The chair also assumes the role of the rapporteur of the Oversight Working Group in the committee, and presents the final report in the plenary session. Once established and mandated the working group drafts the oversight action plan. The action plan spans the timeframe foreseen by the annual work plan of the committee, and the working group should conclude its work within the allotted time, to comply with the deadline for reporting in the plenary session, as planned by the Assembly Work Programme.

The oversight action plan of the working group may include the following activities:

- Identification of obligations deriving from a law, strategic document, or scope of activities of an institution;
- Field visits to closely observe the implementation of a law or policy, or the functioning of an institution;
- Inviting government officials or heads of independent institutions to report in front of the committee or the working group;
- Conducting oversight hearings

When drafting the action plan, the working group is assisted by the committee support staff. The action plan should include the names of the committee staff who will be engaged in assisting the working group; other Assembly units that could provide support in this process, particularly the Research Division; independent experts who could assist the committee; civil society organizations; as well as the necessary technical and financial resources required to implement the action plan.
Chart 1: The planning process for parliamentary oversight initiatives

Government's Legislative Strategy

Parliamentary Committee Oversight Goals (plans)

Parliamentary Committee Annual Working Plan

Kosovo Assembly Annual Working Plan

Oversight Working Group

Oversight Action Plan

Identifying obligations that derive from the law, strategy, statute of the institution

Field Visits

Oversight hearings

The report of Oversight Working Group is presented to the committee and approved

The Oversight report is presented by the committee to the plenary session

Obligatory recommendations to the Government or independent institutions
4. IMPLEMENTATION OF THE ACTION PLAN

The Action plan serves as a guideline for committees as it defines all steps that need to be followed in order to reach the goal of a specific oversight activity. The action plan specifies the details related to the priorities of the oversight activities, timeliness for organizing field visits, organization of the committee hearings and ways other relevant stakeholders will be involved in the process.

4.1. Identifying key aspects of the oversight activity

Before the working group initiates the first direct contact with institutions that will be overseen, there is a need for detailed analysis of legislation and related documents that will serve the working group when conducting oversight. The committee staff, engaged in supporting the working group, should prepare an initial report on the situation prior to the formal establishment of a law, a strategic document or an institution. The initial report will help members of the working group understand the subject matter that will be overseen but also generate potential questions that will be addressed to the officials during the process of field visits or oversight hearings.

For example, the initial report for the oversight of the implementation of a certain law should identify obligations of executive institutions or independent agencies that derive from the law, such as the issuance of secondary legislation or establishment of working bodies. The fourth part of this manual describes in detail the process of oversight of implementation of laws. The same procedure can be followed even in cases when the committee decides to oversee issues other than laws, such as strategies or the performance of state institutions in specific areas.

4.2. Field visits

Following the preparation of the initial report, the working group begins the second stage of oversight, which encompasses direct visits to the executive institutions responsible for the implementation of the laws, specific geographical areas and select communities that are directly affected by the law. Typically committees inform their respective institutions prior to the visit. The committee support staff contacts the responsible persons in the executive institutions and informs them on the goals of the visit by the committee, the composition of the delegation, and the time of the visit. However, if considered necessary, the committee might conduct field visits at any time in order to gather
first hand information. Visits to power plants, mining areas, or certain rivers, to closely monitor implementation of the Law on Protection of the Environment, are good examples of such visits.

4.3. Oversight hearings

Oversight hearings have shown to be a very efficient mechanism used by committees when conducting oversight. Although the Rules of Procedures do not envisage oversight hearings as a specific category, Article 73 provides committees with a broad authority on overseeing the implementation of laws and government policies. This enables them to organize hearings of oversight character and to summon ministers, deputy ministers, and officials of other state institutions to provide explanations and information related to the implementation of government programs, problems with implementation of laws, sensitive political issues or other issues under their jurisdiction. During the hearings, ministers are expected to provide explanations and information as requested by the committee and answer the questions submitted by committee members.

The committee also invites citizens affected by a law or a certain policy, civil society organizations, independent experts, trade unions, business associations. The members of the working group together with the committee support staff identify organizations and individuals who could contribute to the hearing. Following the identification of potential participants, the support staff sends invitations to all organizations and individuals. The invitation is sent at least a week in advance with the purpose of allowing sufficient time for the participants in the public hearing to prepare written reports.

The invitation should contain the name of the committee that convenes the public hearing, the venue of the hearing (associated with information on how to find the room where the hearing will take place), starting time, other potential participants to whom the invitations were sent, and the rules of presentation and addressing the committee. Apart from sending direct invitations in the addresses of the participants, the notice for the public hearing should be published in the official webpage of the Assembly of Kosovo and in the media.

Hearings are usually held in the premises of the Assembly of Kosovo, but sometimes committees also conduct field hearings, in order to reach out certain communities or particular geographical areas. Oversight hearings are usually open to the media and civil society representatives, but can also be closed on certain occasions. Besides government institutions, committees can invite the leaders of independent institutions that report to the Assembly on specific hearings.
The oversight hearing is convened by the chair of the oversight working group who informs the participants of the goal of the oversight function, activities to date, and the order of discussion in the public hearing in accordance with the Assembly Manual for public hearings. As a rule, following the chair, the floor is given to the representative of the implementing authority, whose work is subject to oversight. Following the speech by the representative of the institution which is being monitored, all participants are given up to 10 minutes for discussion, based on the order of their requests to discuss, or based on the importance that their testimony might have. The committee support staff collects all the written testimonies, which will be used to draft the oversight report. The entire hearing is transcribed. Even in cases when the hearings are held outside the premises of the Assembly, apart from taking minutes, the support staff must ensure the full transcription of the testimonies of participants. Staff should also work with the Media and Public Relations Unit to ensure media coverage.

4.4. Engaging civil society organizations and independent experts

Apart from the invitation to participate in the public hearing, civil society organizations and independent experts can be engaged in all stages of oversight. There are civil society organizations whose mission is to oversee the implementation of laws, functioning of institutions or implementation of governmental policies. Therefore, the working group for oversight, assisted by the support staff, identifies civil society organizations that are active in monitoring certain policies. The reports from these organizations are reviewed and the findings presented are verified once more by the working group. Furthermore, the committee may decide to engage certain experts throughout the process. The expert of a given field supports the work of the working group by providing expertise related to the matter under consideration. Inclusion of independent experts and civil society organizations increases the credibility of findings and recommendations revealed by the committee.

4.5. Transparency of oversight activities

Parliamentary oversight activities are a good opportunity to inform the public about the work of the Assembly of Kosovo and the work of institutions in general. Therefore, committees should respect the principle of transparency and ensure openness towards the media and the public. While people should be able to see their members voting and approving legislation, the Assembly should make sure to inform them about the activities of members in ensuring the proper implementation of those laws.
5. OVERSIGHT OF IMPLEMENTATION OF LAWS

In a parliamentary democracy, oversight of implementation of laws by the parliament is as important as the approval. Regardless that oversight of implementation of laws is constantly conducted by civil society and the media, only public institutions have the authority to transfer the findings, into concrete actions that will improve the situation. The Constitution of the Republic of Kosovo recognizes the authority of the Assembly to review and approve legislation, but in the meantime to ensure their effective implementation in practice.

Through oversight of implementation of laws, the Assembly obtains information about the impact of the laws and hold institutions responsible for the implementation of the law accountable, in case deficiencies are encountered. For over a decade the Assembly approved over 300 laws. During this period of time, the Assembly developed the practice of overseeing implementation of laws, but due to the workload and limited capacities only a small number of laws have been overseen so far.

5.1. Annual report of ministries on implementation of laws

The authority of parliamentary committees to oversee laws is based on Article 73 of the Rules of Procedure. Paragraph 2, requires ministries to report at least once per year to the relevant committee without the request of the committee regarding the implementation of the law. The Rules of Procedure do not specify time limits by which the ministry should submit the report to the committee, but this can be arranged in agreement between the functional parliamentary committee and the relevant ministry.

The ministries are directly responsible for the implementation of more than one law, therefore the ministry reports separately for each law, or in agreement with the parliamentary committee it may submit a comprehensive report about the implementation of all the laws for which the ministry is responsible.

The report submitted by the ministry should contain:

- Start date of commencement of the implementation of the law;
- Measures that the Government has taken to implement the law since the date of its entry into force;
- Number of secondary legislation approved and the process of drafting other secondary legislation stipulated by the law;
• Creation of new bodies (boards, departments) that are envisaged by the law;
• Actual financial cost of the implementation of the law (if different from the Financial Impact Assessment, calculated during the time the draft law was submitted to the Assembly);
• Problems encountered during implementation: external difficulties (obstacles in the field) or internal difficulties (lack of capacities to implement or ambiguities in interpretation of provisions of the law);
• Any plans of the ministry to amend and supplement the law.

Based on Article 73, paragraph 4 of the Rules of Procedure, if the ministry fails to report or if its reporting is deemed incomplete, upon the request of the committee, the issue shall be put on the agenda of the next plenary session.

5.2. Obligations of the Committee towards the Assembly

The same as for ministries, parliamentary committees are also required to submit annual reports to the Assembly. Article 73, paragraph 3 of the Rules of Procedure also provides that committees shall report before the Assembly on their overall oversight activities, in writing and orally once a year. The Annual Work Plan of the Assembly envisages submission and presentation of these reports by committees. Annual reports of committees on oversight activities should include:

- Information regarding the achievement of the oversight plan of the committee;
- Laws, overseen during the year;
- Work of the ministries on issuing secondary legislation and establishing bodies required by the law;
- Performance of the ministries in terms of the implementation of policies and management of the annual budget;
- Readiness of ministries to respond to invitations of the committee to report and submit documents or information;
- Engagement of civil society in oversight activities;
- Main recommendations of the committee for the government or independent institutions;
- Plan of the committee for continuous oversight, as well as obligations of the ministries for fulfilling the recommendations and reporting to the committee regarding the progress of implementing the recommendations of the committee.

In the annex XX of this manual you will be able to find an example of the contents of the committee report to the Assembly.
5.3. The process of overseeing the implementation of laws

In accordance with their annual work plans, the committee can decide to oversee the implementation of a certain law under their mandate by a majority of votes. Following the selection of the law that will be monitored, the committee establishes a working group composed of three to five members and sets the deadlines to conclude the oversight process and submit the report with findings and recommendations. The committee might decide that all members will take part in the oversight process. However, the practice so far has shown that establishment of working groups to monitor the implementation of laws has lead to a more efficient process due to easier management of time and oversight activities.

The working group responsible for overseeing the implementation of the law, with the support of the staff, drafts the action plan which outlines overall activities. The action plan should contain the following key elements:

Introduction: date and location, legal basis for appointing the working group for overseeing the implementation of the law, names of the members of the working group, names of the support staff and other parties included in the process;

Main activities: identifying obligations for the implementers, evaluation of compliance of secondary legislation with the law, organization of field visits, organization of the oversight hearing, reporting by the minister or other responsible officials in the committee, preparation and review of the report with recommendations in the committee, review of the report with recommendations in the plenary session, and the report of the minister or the responsible officials in the committee for implementing the recommendations that were approved in the plenary session;

Specific activities: depending on the field that the law covers, the working group could plan various activities such as: conducting research, engaging CSOs, think tanks, or independent experts, etc.;

Timeliness for each activity;

Location where activities will take place;

Description of each activity by mentioning key activities and responsible parties;

The process of overseeing the implementation of the law is divided in four phases:

First phase: identification of obligations for institutions responsible for implementation of laws and verification of compliance of secondary legislation;
Second phase: conducting an oversight field visits;

Third phase: summoning ministers or other responsible officials in the committee meeting, preparation of the report with recommendations by the oversight working group, review and approval of the report with recommendations in the committee, and review and approval of the report with recommendations in the plenary session;

Fourth phase: based on the timelines set forth by the committee, ministers and other government officials report to the committee on the implementation of recommendations of the committee.
Chart 2. Process of overseeing the implementation of a law

**PROCESS OF OVERSEEING THE IMPLEMENTATION OF LAWS**

**FIRST PHASE**
- Action Plan development
- Identification of obligations for institutions responsible
- Verification of compliance of secondary legislation

**SECOND PHASE**
- Conducting an oversight field visits

**THIRD PHASE**
- Summoning ministers or other responsible officials in the committee meeting
- Oversight hearing
- Preparation of the report with recommendations
- Review and approval of the report with recommendations in the committee
- Review and approval of the report with recommendations in the plenary session

**FOURTH PHASE**
- Based on the timelines set forth by the committee, ministers and other government officials report to the committee on the implementation of recommendations of the committee
a) Identifying obligations of institutions responsible for implementing the law

The process of overseeing the implementation of a law begins with identifying the obligations that the law requires for the implementers, including the Prime Ministers Office or a certain ministry, independent institutions, municipalities and private institutions. The committee clerk prepares a document or chart, which outlines the obligations deriving from the law, for each institution that is responsible for its implementation. Technically the document can be separated into two columns. The text of the law may be placed in one side, while in the other column explains the obligations for the implementers which will be monitored during the oversight process. In case the law is amended and supplemented the document should be separated into three columns, while the second column includes the text of the amended and supplemented law.

The committee staff analyzes the law clause-by-clause and identifies key aspects that will be overseen. Actual practices show that the following are key aspects in which committees are focused when monitoring implementation of laws: identification of secondary legislation that the ministry should issue within the deadline, the establishment of new bodies that are foreseen by the law, the respect of certain conditions and criteria and other specific enumerated duties provided by the law. This chart is presented to members of the working group for review. The document will serve as basic information to get acquainted with the law and the issues that need to be overseen. Based on this document, the staff of the committee may draft a list of questions that will serve the working group during field visits.

b) Assessment for compliance of secondary legislation

Following the identification of secondary legislation, which is envisaged to be issued by the executive institutions, the committee clerk prepares a chart on the assessment of compliance of secondary legislation with the provisions of the law. Technically the document may be separated into three columns. Provisions of the law that require issuance of secondary legislation are placed in the first column, the titles and numbers of secondary legislation are placed in the second column, while comments on compliance are placed in the third column.

The assessment for compliance is done by comparing the provisions of the law with the provisions of the secondary legislation. An assessment of the compliance of the secondary legislation in terms of legal basis is conducted first. Then, the clerk analyzes the secondary legislation clause by clause to ensure that it is in compliance with provisions of the law. The experience so far has shown that due to a lack of a system for automatic referral of secondary acts in the Assembly, which
does not allow for systematic oversight of implementation of laws, often secondary legislation issued by executive institutions exceed limitations set forth by law. In case conflicting provisions are revealed, the committee clerk may also consult the legal office of the respective ministry and request additional explanations.

The chart on the compliance of secondary legislation, which aims at identifying eventual conflicting provisions or identified discrepancies between the law and secondary legislation, usually represents the findings of the first phase of the oversight process. When secondary acts exceed authorization set forth by law and undermine the goal of the latter, members will use these findings to request clarification from ministers and hold them accountable.

Since there is not automatic referral of secondary acts in the Assembly, committee staff can either check if they can be found in the official web site of relevant institutions or, submit a written request directly to the legal office. The secondary legislation includes: administrative instructions, directives, regulations, decisions or manuals.

c) Field visits

Field visits usually take place once the research on the compliance of secondary legislation is completed and presented to the working group. By then, members of the committee and staff have already identified problematic areas of the law and eventual gaps in the secondary acts. Visits to institutions responsible for implementation of the law and site visits in relevant institutions, communities, or certain regions allow members to closely observe the impact of the law and eventual deficiencies in its implementation.

Members of the committee use field visits to discuss about challenges of responsible institutions in implementing and enforcing the law, but also request their input in terms of the need to amend the law or secondary legislation in case of gaps or deficiencies identified in the implementation phase. Members will also meet with certain communities, interest groups, and citizens in order to better understand the situation. For example meetings with officials from the Ministry of Health, health care sector workers, workers’ unions, targeted civil society organizations, and patients would be organized when overseeing the implementation of the Law on Health. Members highly appreciate these visits as a way to reach out to constituents and gather first hand information on difficulties faced in the implementation of the law.

Prior to the field visits, it is crucial that the working group is well informed and briefed by the committee staff. All briefing materials should be made available to the working members at least three days prior to the visit. The committee staff is responsible for also coordinating the logistics for the field visit such as arranging meetings and ensuring transportation.
Committee staff should always take notes during meetings and, when possible, record the discussion and prepare minutes. The committee staff should work with the media office and issue a press release on the event and when possible, ensure media coverage.

**d) Summoning the minister or responsible officials**

Based on the action plan, the working group may summon the minister or the responsible official to testify in one of the committee meetings with regard to the implementation of a certain law. The working group usually prepares a list of questions to be addressed to the minister or the responsible official.

The meeting is led by the committee chair, but the meeting can also be chaired by the chair of the working group upon the authorization of the committee chair. Committee members present their questions and the minister or the responsible official needs to answer all of the questions. Furthermore, the minister or the responsible official should submit in writing a report on the implementation of the law. However, it might be requested that the report is supplemented with issues that derive from the meeting, and it would need to be re-submitted within the deadline set by the committee.

Following the decision to summon the minister, the chair of the working group in coordination with the chair of the committee convenes a regular committee meeting. The committee clerk officially informs the minister or the responsible official at least seven days before the meeting takes place. They need to be informed in detail about the purpose of the meeting and other arrangements. The clerk needs to inform the Public and Media Relations Unit to cover the meeting and ensure media coverage. The clerk should also ensure that the officers under his responsibility are taking minutes and are recording the meeting. These will later serve the working group as information or data to draft the final report.

**e) Oversight hearing**

With the aim of collecting data about the state in implementation of the law, the working group may also organize an oversight hearing. The purpose of the hearings is to allow all relevant stakeholders to voice the challenges for the implementation of the law in practice. Usually, the oversight hearings gather the representatives of the relevant ministry, who are responsible for the implementation of the law, representatives of public and private institutions, civil society organizations, interest groups, experts.

The working group authorizes the committee clerk to begin preparations for organizing an oversight hearing. The committee clerk, in consultation
with the working group, prepares the list of invitees for the hearing. The committee should also consider inviting think tanks, individual experts, or professional consultancy companies that might be helpful in providing the committee insights on challenges in implementation of the law.

The invitations should be distributed at least seven days prior to the hearing. The invitations may be distributed also by email to those for whom the committee has addresses. The invitation should highlight that participants should provide the committee with written testimonies, remarks, or recommendations. At the same time, the Public and Media Relations Unit, which is responsible for informing the media outlets that cover the work of the Assembly, should be informed so they can post the information regarding the hearing in the official webpage.

At least a day prior to the hearing, the clerk should prepare a scenario for the chair of the working group to assist him/her to manage the discussion and time. A list of questions to be addressed to the participants during the hearing, should be prepared by the working group. From the technical aspect, the committee support staff should prepare the signature list, nametags, and all other necessary materials for the meeting.

On the day of the hearing, the committee clerk should distribute assignments to the other staff. The support staff should ensure that the room and the sound equipment (for transcripts) are working properly; they should send a list of invitees to the security to facilitate their entrance and guide the attendants. Apart from the working group, the other members of the committee may also attend the hearing. The hearing is usually chaired by the head of the working group, who opens the meeting and highlights the purpose of the hearings. Afterwards, participants are given 10 minutes each to present their remarks and recommendations, which is usually followed by questions addressed from members of the committee. The chair should request that if the participants have their testimonies or presentations in written form, they should submit them to the support staff. Following the conclusion of the hearing, the clerk collects all testimonies submitted in writing and starts working on the transcript of the hearing. At this stage, they should also begin processing the information that they deem important for the following steps of the working group in the oversight process.

Preparation of the report with recommendations by the working group
The working group supported by the clerk processes all the data gathered during the oversight activities, and prioritizes them for inclusion in the final report. Initially, the clerk prepares the first draft, which is later reviewed in detail by the working group members. Once revised and finalized the draft of the report is put to a vote in the working group. Following the approval of the draft report, the working group authorizes the clerk to edit the text and prepare the report for a final review and approval by the committee.
The report for oversight of the implementation of the law should be structures as follows:

- Introduction
- The purpose of overseeing the implementation of the law
- Description of the activities of the working group
- Description of the identified problems regarding the implementation of the law
- Recommendations for the implementers of the law

i) Review of the report with recommendations by the committee

The report drafted by the working group should be reviewed and approved by the committee during a regular meeting. The chair of the working group requests from the chair of the committee a review of the report with recommendations for the oversight of the implementation of the law in the agenda during one of the committee meetings. When reviewing the report in the committee meeting, members have the right to discuss and propose changes to the report.

Proposals coming from committee members, especially those that were not part of the working group, should be well argued in order to be taken into account by the committee. Finally, all proposals for amending and supplementing the report should be voted on one by one by the majority of votes. At the end, the report needs to be approved as a whole. Following the voting process, by the majority of votes of those present, it is deemed that the report with recommendations is approved.

The committee staff is authorized to finalize the text of the approved proposals and prepare the report for further proceedings. At this stage the report is submitted to the Assembly Presidency, recommending inclusion in the agenda for the following plenary session.

j) Review of the report in the plenary session

The Assembly Presidency reviews the recommendations of the committee and includes the report with recommendations in the agenda for the plenary session. When reviewing the report in the plenary session, the relevant ministers should be present. On behalf of the committee, the chair, or the head of the working group presents the report with recommendations. Following the presentation of the report, the heads of parliamentary groups take the floor and present their
positions with regard to findings and recommendations the report. Other members who wish to contribute to the process may take the floor as well. Following the debate, the report with recommendations is put to vote and all the remarks and recommendations are approved with the majority of votes.

Once the report is approved the Table Office officially submits the report to the implementing institution. The report approved by the Assembly represents an obligation for the Government or the responsible ministry to implement the recommendations set by the Assembly and report back in the Assembly with regard to the state of implementation.

**k) Reporting on implementation of recommendations of the Assembly**

The last phase in the oversight of laws is the reporting to the committee by the minister or the responsible official on the state of implementation of the recommendations approved in the plenary session. Once the report is approved in the plenary session, a deadline to implement the recommendations of the Assembly is set for the government or the ministry. Once the deadline has passed, the responsible committee summons the minister to report on implementation of recommendations of the report approved by the Assembly.

The committee requests information and arguments regarding the implementation of the recommendations from the minister. If the recommendations are not implemented, the Committee requests again that the minister implement the recommendations as soon as possible. If the committee is not satisfied with the outcomes, they might decide to raise the issue in the plenary session and request clarifications on delays. The follow up from the committee is crucial in this process as it pressures the executive institutions to undertake actions needed to ensure proper implementation of the law.
6. Oversight of the state budget

The right to authorize revenue collection and spending of public funds is one of the most important powers of the Assembly. Additionally, the Assembly has a critical role in overseeing the expenditure of public funds. Efficient budgetary oversight helps improve budget management practices, reduction of gaps in execution of the budget and most importantly prevents corruption. Budgetary oversight also helps the Assembly understand better the budgetary allocations in certain sectors and reduce the budget of institutions that were not efficient in managing the budget in the previous year.

6.1 The law on the budget of the Republic of Kosovo

The law on the budget of Kosovo is one of the most important laws approved by the Assembly of Kosovo every year. Article 65 paragraph 5 of the Constitution of the Republic of Kosovo outlines that “the Assembly approves the budget of the Republic of Kosovo”. Further, based on the Law no.03/L-048 on Public Financial Management and Accountability, the Government is obliged to submit to the Assembly the proposed Kosovo Budget and Proposed Appropriations Law no later than October 31 of each fiscal year. The Appropriations Law is approved by the Assembly and authorizes budget organizations to spend or transfer public funds and to up to a set limit for a specified purpose during a given fiscal year.

Apart from the right to approve the Law on the Budget of the Republic of Kosovo, the Assembly also has the mandate to:

- Authorize the extension of the time of the implementation of the Law on Appropriations of the previous fiscal year, in the circumstances foreseen by Article 24 of Law no.03/L-048 Public Financial Management and Accountability;
- Authorize budget transfer amounts greater than 25% of the budget allocated for that particular category;
- Approve amendments to the Law on the Budget, if the costs or revenues to the Kosovo Budget are lower or higher than those prescribed by law;
- Approve the Mid Term Expenditure Framework, which is prepared by the Government and sent to the Assembly no later than April 30 of each calendar year.

---

1. Article 22 para. 1 of the Law no.03/L-048 on Public Financial Management and Accountability.
2. Article 1 para. 1 of the Law no.03/L-048 on Public Financial Management and Accountability.
3. Article 30.4 of the Law no.03/L-048 and Art 8 of the Law no.03/L-221.
4. Article 25 of the Law no.03/L-048 and Article 8 of the Law no.03/L-221 for Amending and Supplementing the Law no.03/L-048 on Public Financial Management and Accountability.
5. Article 19 of the Law no.03/L-048 and Article 5 of the Law no.03/L-221.
The Budget and Finance Committee (BFC) is responsible for reviewing and amending the Draft Law on Budget. BFC is a permanent committee of the Assembly of Kosovo. The committee, within its scope of activities and responsibilities, reviews all issues pertaining to the budget and finances in Kosovo.\(^6\) In exercising its functions the committee cooperates with the ministry of the respective domain and all other ministries, from which can request specific data, including direct reporting from the ministers or other responsible officials when this is requested by the committee.\(^7\)

Apart from the Budget and Finance Committee, other functional committees may organize budgetary hearings to review the draft budget of the ministries or the independent institutions under their scope of authority. Engagement of other parliamentary committees is crucial particularly in reviewing the budget of independent institutions. The Assembly has the authority to review, amend, and approve the budget for these institutions. During the budgeting process for an independent institution with dedicated revenue Government has the authority to modify a proposed budget or appropriations request for such an independent agency. The Minister and the Prime Ministers Office shall ensure that all proposed budgets and appropriations requests are incorporated, without modification, into the proposed KCB and the proposed Appropriations Law and submitted to the Assembly.\(^8\)

Therefore, the fairest way of considering the budget of independent institutions, without jeopardizing the independence of these institutions, is to review the draft budgets within the functional committees. After the budgetary hearings, committees send their recommendations to the BFC. Committees and the Assembly generally do not have the responsibility and the right to participate in planning the budget. This right and responsibility falls exclusively on the executive. However, the Assembly and the committees may play a significant role in the appropriations from the moment the Government submits the draft-law on the budget in the Assembly. For the process of reviewing and amending the budget to be more effective, the parliamentary committees may ask for preliminary research and analysis of the content and the impact of the draft budget for the upcoming fiscal year.

The research and analysis may focus on:

- **Sector analysis**, which may assist the parliamentary committees in understanding whether the proposed budget is in the line with the proclaimed priorities, such as European integration. By analyzing the expenses based on sectors, members may understand better which sectors have been given more priority, such as: education, health, defense, infrastructure, etc.;

---

\(^6\) For the scope of work of the committee, refer to the Annex II of the Rules of Procedure of the Assembly of Kosovo.  
\(^7\) Rules of Procedure of the Assembly of Kosovo: Annex Nr. 2 – Scope of Activities and Responsibilities of the Assembly Committees. 29 April 2010  
\(^8\) Article 66 of the Law no.03/L-048.
- **Analysis based on geographical aspect**, which assists the committees in better understanding the geographical distribution of investments, whether the same priority for investments was given to all the municipalities in Kosovo in proportion to the number of citizens, territory and the urgent need for government subsidies;

- **Analysis on the impact that the budget might have on certain groups in society**, or how would the budget allocation impact the families with social welfare, pensioners, minorities, residents in remote mountainous areas, etc.

All the above mentioned analysis assist the parliamentary committees, to understand the overall content of the draft budget, to make the decisions for amending and supplementing the draft budget, and also later for easier oversight of the implementation of the budget. When committee proposes amendments to the draft budget submitted by the Government, the staff should make sure to clearly outline changes requested by the committee. Budget and Finance committee staff should make sure that such changes are reflected in the total budget of that specific institution. The committee should also provide justification for any proposed changes. And most importantly, during the budgetary hearings, the committee staff should make sure that representatives of relevant institution are invited, along with representatives of the Ministry of Finance.

### 6.2 Reporting of budgetary organizations in the Assembly

Following the approval of appropriations in the Assembly of Kosovo, the Kosovo Constitution, the Law on the Budget of Kosovo, the Law on Public Financial Management and Accountability, and the laws establishing the independent institutions, bind them to submit quarterly and annual reports on budget expenditures and revenues. The Law on Budget requires regular reporting of expenditures and revenues every fiscal year to the Assembly and the committees. For example, the Kosovo Budget Law for 2012 provides that: “at any time when requested by the Assembly, the Minister, on behalf of the Government presents to the Assembly a comprehensive report that provides details and reconciliation of appropriations approved for 2012, and all subsequent transfers and other changes, and final appropriations for fiscal year 2012 “.9

The Government is required to submit to the Assembly a report on each budget organization within thirty days after such report is presented to the Government by the related budget organization.10

---

9 Article 3, paragraph 3 of the Law no.04/L-079 for the Budget of the Republic of Kosovo for 2012.
10 Article 44.6 of the Law no.03/L-048.
The Minister shall prepare and the Government shall review quarterly reports covering the fiscal year through the end of the quarter. Such reports shall be submitted to the Assembly within thirty (30) days from the end of each quarter and then published by the Minister.11 No later than March 31 of each calendar year, the Minister shall prepare and submit to the Government, for approval and submission to the Assembly, a final budget reconciliation report on the budget for the previous fiscal year and the two prior two fiscal years.12

In addition, the Auditor General shall prepare and submit to the Assembly a report on the financial statements of budget organizations and public undertakings for the previous fiscal year. This report shall provide the Auditor General’s opinion on whether or not the financial statements give a true and fair view of the finances of such budget organizations and public undertakings.13

Even the General Director of the Treasury is obligated to provide an annual report to the Assembly on all the matters relating to the operation of the Treasury and the implementation of the FMC Rules and the Kosovo Consolidated Budget. Each such report shall include an Article that describes the most significant problems with the Treasury’s operations and the implementation of the FMC Rules and the Kosovo Consolidated Budget, and provides the General Director’s recommendations on possible solutions to the problems described.14 Annex 8 describes in a table format the deadlines for budgeting, government obligations and Assembly’s engagements in this process.

6.3 Oversight of implementation of the budget by committees

The legal basis that allow committees to review, amend, and approve the state budget was elaborated upon above, and the obligations of the Government and budget organizations shall be highlighted separately, to report on regular bases on expenditures and revenues. Committee should conduct ongoing budgetary oversight of line ministries and independent institutions under their jurisdiction based on the quarterly, biannual and annual financial reports of the Government. The budgetary oversight allows committee to better understand expenditures, and be able to make the necessary amendments when the draft budget for the following year is submitted. When overseeing the implementation of the budget, committees should focus on the following:

11 Article 45.1 of the Law no.03/L-048.
12 Refer to the Article 45.1 of the Law no.03/L-048 on what should the government report on annual expenditures contain.
13 Ibid, Art. 47.1.
14 Ibid, Art. 4.9.
- Did the institution accomplish its annual plan of revenues? If not, what are the obstacles that prevent the institution to implement the plan?
- How was the budget spent by category, e.g., goods and services or capital investments?
- Is the budget spent equitably throughout the year, or is the budget mainly spent in specific periods of the year (as it usually is the case with capital investments category)?
- Is the budget allocated to specific institutions sufficient or additional budget is needed in the following year?
- In case of budget surplus, is it explained by the inability of the institution to manage its budget, or should the institution operate in a lower budget?
- Reports of the Auditor General, and opinions of the Public Accounts Committee
- Comparison of Audit Reports with periodic reports of expenditures presented by the government

This form of budgetary oversight increased the performance of institutions in managing the budget, avoids abuse of public funds and prevent corruption.

**a. Committee on Oversight of Public Finances**

Most advanced legislatures have established special committees for the oversight of public finances, to oversee the integrity, economy, efficiency, and effectiveness of government financial management by examining government financial documents and considering the reports of the Auditor General. Such an example was followed by the Assembly of Kosovo, when in 2009 it established the Committee on Oversight of Public Finances.

So far, the committee has built the necessary administrative capacities to exercise its oversight function. The committee has the right to summon officials of an institution whose financial statements have been audited and to seek accountability for the findings of the auditor. Depending on the report of the auditor, the Committee may come up with recommendations for measures to be undertaken for officials who have not implemented the budget accordingly, as it is foreseen by the law on budget and other laws on public finances. The committee may also cooperate with other parliamentary committees, when the committees take the initiative to oversee the implementation of the budget by the ministries, public enterprises, independent agencies or regulators.
b. Budgetary oversight by other committees

The parliamentary oversight of the implementation of the budget aims at increasing the transparency on how funds are spent; it helps increase control and reduce mismanagement of funds and corruptive cases. Therefore, apart from the oversight of the programmes, laws, and policies, the committee should also oversee the implementation of the budget of that institution and how the priorities and strategies of the institution are connected with the budget.

The budget process is quite complex, and it is impossible for all the committees to hire exclusively professional staff that are familiarized with the budget process and that are experienced in assisting the committee with the oversight of the implementation of the budget by a certain institution. In the absence of this, the parliamentary committees, during their oversight work, use the expertise and support of the Committee on Oversight of Public Finances, Parliamentary Research Division, civil society organizations, and independent experts.

Apart from regular reporting forms by the institutions, the parliamentary committees, during the process of overseeing the implementation of the budget may request additional information. This information may include:

- Information on the state of implementation of programs/projects
- The overall number of employees of certain institutions and the level of salaries for each employee;
- Expenses for representation and detailed information who spent how much for representation, in which meetings and the reasoning for these expenses;
- Detailed information on communication expenses, the number of phones purchased, and communication expenses for mobile and fixed lines;
- The number of vehicles, rules for their usage, log sheets, expenditures for fuel, individuals from the institution who used these rights and their reasoning;
- Expenses for visits abroad, the reasoning of the visits, the number of participants in these visits, etc.

Institutions are required to respond with accuracy and punctuality to the requests of parliamentary committee for additional information on the expenditure of the budget. The figure below presents the cycle of drafting and oversight of the budget, by three actors and three different levels of control and oversight.
Besides laws and other secondary legislation, strategic documents and action plans also play an important role in the scope of activities of institutions. Over the past years, the Government has approved numerous of strategies and action plans. But, when required by law, a number of strategies need to have the approval of the Assembly before they can enter into force.

The strategic documents set the development objectives that an institution should achieve during a certain timeframe. The action plans serve to materialize objectives and plan future steps, detailed timeframes, institutions responsible for the implementation, and the cost of each action.

Though the Assembly does not have a say in the content of the strategies and the action plans, they provide important information on future goals. As such, efficient oversight of the implementation of these strategies pressures relevant institutions to implement them properly. Another reason why committees oversee the implementation of the strategies and action plan is that the public funds that are allocated for the implementation of the activities are set in action plans.
At the beginning of the year, members of the committee with the support of staff identify specific strategies under their jurisdiction to be monitored. Committee clerk shall prepare an action plan for oversight which envisages a detailed review and analysis of relevant documents, field visits, oversight hearings as well as meetings with citizens and civil society organizations. When monitoring implementation of government strategies, the committee should focus on the following issues:

- Are objectives envisaged in the strategy accomplished?
- Did the government allocate funds necessary to implement the strategy? If not, how they plan to ensure funding?
- Performance of institutions responsible for implementation of the strategy?

Depending on the final outcome of the oversight process, the committee may recommend the Government to revise certain elements of the strategy, or request them to undertake specific measures to improve implementation. Regardless of the fact that implementation of strategies is under the jurisdiction of the Government, the Assembly should ensure ongoing oversight, particularly in terms of funding. Annex 7 of this manual provides a list of all strategies in force is attached, the date of their approval in the Government, the date of approval in the Assembly, the implementing authority, and the Assembly committee responsible for overseeing their implementation.

6.5 The Assembly’s role in overseeing Government actions in addressing EU Progress Report findings

The Assembly’s permanent Committee on European Integration has an important role in overseeing the integration processes and the harmonization of laws and national policies with those of the EU acquis. The Committee monitors the implementation of the European Partnership Action Plan (EPAP). EPAP is a strategic document of the Government of Kosovo has approved each year since 2008. The purpose of EPAP is addressing the issues identified in the Progress Report of the European Commission on Kosovo. The Ministry for European Integration (MEI) handles the coordination and oversight for the EPAP implementation on the governmental level. The Committee for European Integration, in coordination with other functional committees, oversees in regular basis the implementation of the EPAP.

On an annual basis, the Committee drafts and oversees the implementation of the Action Plan of the Assembly of Kosovo for European Integration. Following the publication of the yearly report of the European Commission on the progress achieved in Kosovo and the challenges that need to be resolved, the committee initiates the procedure for drafting the Assembly action plan for resolving the challenges that were mentioned in the Progress Report for Kosovo.
Action Plan of the Assembly of Kosovo for European Integration includes:

- The challenges of the Progress Report for Kosovo;
- The responsible executive institutions for the implementation of these challenges;
- The responsible parliamentary committees who commit to call to oversight hearings the officials from institutions to report regarding the progress achieved in implementing the challenges of the progress report;
- The timeframes when the committees call the executive officials to appear in the committee meetings to report;
- The timeframes by which the Committee for European Integration, after it has collected the oversight reports from other committees, submits a regular quarterly report to the Assembly of Kosovo for the implementation of the Action Plan for Integration.

Following the identification of challenges, the responsible parliamentary committees include in their own annual work plans the activities foreseen by the Assembly Action Plan for Integration. Based on the Action Plans for European Integration, committees set timeframes for inviting the government officials to report. The invitation to appear in front of the committee also contains the challenges for the progress of implementation on which the representative of the executive institution should report. During these oversight meetings, representatives from civil society organizations and independent experts may be invited to report independently.

Following the collection of testimonies and reports, the functional committees draft a report which they send to CIE, whereas CIE following the collection of reports by all committees submits a quarterly report to the Assembly on the implementation of the Assembly Action Plan for European Integration.
7. Oversight of independent institutions

Independent institutions are established by the Assembly of Kosovo, in accordance with the laws that define their scope of activities. These institutions are considered independent, as they answer only to the Assembly of Kosovo. The Constitution of the Republic of Kosovo envisages the existence of at least five independent institutions:

1. Ombudsperson
2. General Auditor
3. Central Elections Commission
4. Central Bank
5. Independent Media Commission

Beside the institutions outlined above, the Assembly has the right to establish other independent institutions, usually known as independent agencies or regulators. The Constitution of the Republic of Kosovo defines independent agencies as institutions established by the Assembly based on the respective laws that regulate their establishment, operation and competencies. Independent agencies exercise their functions independently from any other body or authority in the Republic of Kosovo. Independent agencies have their own budget which should be administered independently in accordance with the law. All other state institutions are bound to cooperate with and respond to the requests of the independent agencies during the exercise of their legal competencies in a manner provided by law. Independent regulators are institutions that set the rules of operation in different fields of the market, such as energy, telecommunications, transport, etc.

The experience so far has shown that the Assembly faces major challenges with regard to the work with independent institutions. Unclear legal basis for reporting, poor coordination with the Government in selection of board members and failure to determine mechanisms for holding board members accountable, are among key problems faced by the Assembly. Regardless of the fact that independent institutions are only responsible to the Assembly, the Government selects the short list of candidates for board members of independent institutions, whereas the Assembly makes the final decision. The selection process for board members created problems in the committees, as members often have the impression that short listed candidates are often affiliated to governing parties and are not qualified. Therefore, oversight of independent institutions remains one of the challenges for the Assembly, which needs to be properly addressed.

15 Article 45.1 of the Law no.03/L-048.
7.1 Responsibilities of the Assembly towards independent institutions

As the founder of the independent institutions (agencies and regulators), the Assembly of Kosovo has the responsibility to create the conditions for their work, such as premises, budget, and appointment of members in managerial positions. Only the Assembly of Kosovo is responsible for the final budget of independent institutions. During the budgeting process for independent institutions with dedicated revenue, neither the Minister nor the Government has the authority to modify a proposed budget or appropriations request for such an independent agency, if such document has been submitted on time and conforms to the format requirements specified in the budget circular. If such a document is not submitted to the Minister of Finance by the specified date, the Minister shall have the authority to develop a proposed budget and appropriations request for the particular independent agency that is based on, but not greater than, the then current fiscal year’s budget and appropriations.\textsuperscript{16}

7.2 Approval of the budget for independent institutions

The draft budget prepared in the required format set by budget circulars by the independent institutions is sent to the Ministry of Finance (MF). The MF has no right of intervention in the draft budget of the independent institution and includes the draft budget of the independent institution in the Budget Tables, which are sent to the Government and Assembly for approval. Following the approval of the Draft Law on Budget in the first reading in parliamentary session, the Committee for Budget and Finances requires other functional committees to review the draft budget of the independent institution under their scope of authority. The functional committees summons the management of independent institutions to provide explanations for their proposed budget.

Following the review of the draft budget of the independent institution, the functional committee drafts a report to present the amendments in the draft budget of the independent institution proposed by the committee. This allows members of the committee to understand the budget allocations within the independent institutions and be more efficient in conducting oversight throughout the year. CBF has the right to accept, intervene, or reject the recommendations of the functional committee regarding the draft budget of the independent institutions. Following the review of the draft budget for each independent institution, the CBF submits the Draft Law on Budget and the Budget Appropriations for approval in the second reading in the Assembly.

\textsuperscript{16} Article 66, paragraph 1 of the Law no.03/L-048.
Many deficiencies have been encountered in the process of reviewing and handling annual reports of independent institutions. Annual financial reports of independent institutions have been reviewed and approved before the report of the Auditor General on the same institution was issued. Often, committees would approve the annual report submitted by the institution with minor remarks, while the report of the Auditor General on the same institution would reveal many irregularities in terms of financial management. Therefore, when reviewing annual financial reports of independent institutions, the committee staff with the support of the Division for Research should conduct research and prepare a report that summarizes financial performance of the institution in the previous years, focusing mainly on the findings of the Auditor General for the previous years. These will allow committees to be more efficient in overseeing the budget of independent institutions.

7.3 Appointment of heads of institutions and board members

The Assembly of Kosovo, through the parliamentary committees, has the right to appoint the members of top managerial positions of independent institutions. The procedures for selecting the managing officials of independent institutions vary. The rules for selecting and appointing the heads of these institutions are defined by the law which establishes the independent institution. But in general, there are two ways of selecting the heads of independent institutions:

1. The Government announces an advertisement for the vacant position in the independent institution, leads the process of selection and interviews, and the names of the best candidates are sent to the Assembly for final approval; or
2. The Assembly undertakes all the necessary procedures: advertising, interviewing and selection.

The mandate of board members varies from one independent institution to another. There are cases when board members of the same institution have different length of mandate. The practice so far has shown that the process of replacing of board members whose mandate is expired or extension of their mandate, was delayed for months. There is no system in place for monitoring the mandate of board members of each independent institution. Therefore, at the beginning of the year, the committee staff should develop a chart that provides data on board members for each institution under the jurisdiction of the committee; include the date of appointment and the date the mandate expires. This chart would allow members to be informed on measures they need to undertake in order to ensure timely replacement or extension of mandate for board member.
Regardless of the fact that the Government is responsible for publication of vacancy announcements and interviewing/selection process, the committee may request from the Government to initiate the process of replacing or extending the mandate of board members in independent institutions. The committee may also request from the government officials to report on preparations and plans for managing the selection processes for board members of these institutions. Early inclusion of committees in selection of board members would prevent situations where their mandate expires while procedures for replacement or extension of the mandate are not initiated on time.

### 7.4 Responsibilities of independent institutions towards the Assembly

The Assembly of Kosovo apart from establishing, approving their budget and selecting the managers of the independent institutions, also oversees their work. The independent institutions are obligated to report to the Assembly on an annual basis. The Assembly also has the right to request reports and explanations throughout the year.

The deadlines for submitting the annual reports vary for each institution and are defined in the laws of their establishment. Usually independent institutions are obligated to submit their annual report by March 31 of the upcoming fiscal year. The content of the reports varies based on the scope of activities of the institution. There is no law or secondary act that defines the rules for drafting the annual report. Some laws set some basic requirements regarding content of the reports for the institutions that submit them to the Assembly.

#### The report of the Central Bank *

The Central Bank shall, within six months after the close of its financial year, submit to the Assembly of Republic of Kosovo and the Minister and publish one or more reports, approved by the Central Bank Board, on the state of the economy during the financial year that just ended, including:

- an overview for the economy for the coming year;
- achievements of its policy objectives and the condition of the financial system of Kosovo;
- a review and assessment of the Central Bank’s policies followed last financial year and a description; and,
- explanations of the Bank’s policies to be followed during the next financial year.

* Law no.03/L-209 for the Central Bank of Kosovo, article 28.2.
However, annual reports are expected to provide the following information:

- A short overview of the mission and the scope of activities of the institution;
- The legal basis for its operation;
- The organizational structure of the mission (boards, departments, units);
- The overall situation of the sector that the institution or regulator operates or regulates;
- The budget of the institution and its implementation;
- Staffing conditions, recruitments, or dismissals during the last year, the level of salaries and their professional capacities;
- All the activities of the institution during the year: review of cases, applications for licenses, approval of requests, participations in trainings, international forums, etc.
- The problems faced by the institution during the last year;
- The plan and additional resources required by the institution to overcome difficulties;
- The income generated by the institution (if it is an institution that generates income).

The content of regular reports of independent institutions may evolve with time, as a consequence of additional competencies of these institutions, or as a result of recommendations that parliamentary committees may address to the institution to complement future reports. The parliamentary committees, apart from regular reports, may request special reports for a particular issue. This is foreseen by the Rules of Procedure of the Assembly, but also by certain laws that regulate the scope of activities of the committee. Special reports may serve as part of a more systematic oversight that the committee may undertake to oversee from a close distance the work of an independent institution. The committee may undertake oversight visits, organize oversight hearings, and obtain the opinions of civil society and independent experts. The procedures for the oversight of independent institutions are similar to the oversight of laws, budget, and strategies.

At the beginning of the year the committee staff should prepare a calendar that outlines dates when independent institutions should report in the committee. In case of delays in submitting the reports, the committee clerk should bring that to the attention of the committee Chair. The committee should authorize the Clerk to send a note to the independent institution, requesting them to submit the report in accordance with the deadline set fort by law. A mode of the calendar for reporting of independent institutions is provided in Annex X of the manual.
8. Annexes
Committee for ... [Name of the Committee]

Action plan for the oversight of the implementation of the Law on ... [Name of the law]

Date/month/year
Place

The working group, based on the decision of the Committee for... [Name of the Committee], during the meeting dated... [Write date] prepares the Action plan for the oversight of the implementation of the Law on... [Name of the law].

Members of the working group

1. Name and surname, Chair
2. Name and surname
3. Name and surname
4. Name and surname
5. Name and surname

Committee support staff

1. Name and surname, Clerk
2. Name and surname, Field officer
3. Name and surname, Legal officer

Associates:

1. Name and surname
2. Name and surname
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Time frame</th>
<th>Activities</th>
<th>Location / time</th>
<th>Remarks</th>
<th>Responsible persons</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>First phase</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Week I</strong> (Date/month)</td>
<td>Preparation of the action plan for the oversight of the implementation of the law...</td>
<td>Location Day/Date Time Room</td>
<td>The Committee Coordinator prepares the action plan in cooperation with the working group, based on which all oversight activities are conducted.</td>
<td>Working Group Coordinator</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Identification of the obligations that derive from the law for the Government, public and private institutions.</td>
<td></td>
<td>This document will serve the members of the working group to focus on main issues or provisions for oversight.</td>
<td>Clerk</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Evaluation of compliance of secondary legislation with the law</td>
<td></td>
<td>The Committee support staff prepares an evaluation regarding the compliance of secondary legislation issued by the Ministry with the Law on...</td>
<td>Clerk</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Second phase</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Week II</strong> (Date/month)</td>
<td>Visits in the Ministry for...</td>
<td>Location Day/Date Time Room</td>
<td>The working group supported by the committee staff visits the Ministry for... with the aim to obtain information regarding the level of implementation of the Law on...</td>
<td>Working Group Coordinator</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• The Secretary of the Ministry</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Legal office of the Ministry</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Department ...</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Week III</strong></td>
<td>Visits in the Kosovo Municipalities:</td>
<td>Location Day/Date Time</td>
<td>The working group decides which municipalities or cities will be visited. Whereas, the Committee support staff arranges the meetings with the defined</td>
<td>Working Group Coordinator</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. Municipality of...:</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• The directorate for...</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(Date/month)</td>
<td></td>
<td>Room</td>
<td>entities.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Week IV</strong>&lt;br&gt;(Date/month)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Municipality of Pristina</td>
<td>• The directorate for health&lt;br&gt;• The directorate for inspection&lt;br&gt;• Commercial or hotel premises</td>
<td>Location&lt;br&gt;Day/Date&lt;br&gt;Time&lt;br&gt;Room</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Municipality of Mitrovica</td>
<td>• The directorate for health&lt;br&gt;• The directorate for inspection&lt;br&gt;• Commercial or hotel premises</td>
<td>Location&lt;br&gt;Day/Date&lt;br&gt;Time&lt;br&gt;Room</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Visits in two companies that deal with tobacco</td>
<td>• A company for the production of tobacco ...&lt;br&gt;• A company for tobacco import ...</td>
<td>Location&lt;br&gt;Day/Date&lt;br&gt;Time&lt;br&gt;Room</td>
<td>The working group selects two companies that deal with the production and import of tobacco to visit them.</td>
<td>Working Group Coordinator</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Visit in... [Name of the institution or the place that will be visited]</td>
<td></td>
<td>Location&lt;br&gt;Day/Date&lt;br&gt;Time&lt;br&gt;Room</td>
<td>The working group supported by the Committee staff visits... with the aim to obtain information regarding the implementation of the provisions of the Law on... that fall in the competence of this institution.</td>
<td>Working Group Coordinator</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Week V</td>
<td>Location</td>
<td>The Minister on... is invited by the Committee to report on the level of implementation of the Law on...</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>--------</td>
<td>-----------</td>
<td>----------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Day/Date Time Room</td>
<td>Committee Working Group Coordinator</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Week VI</th>
<th>Location</th>
<th>The committee supported by the Committee support staff and in cooperation with... [Support organization] organizes an oversight/legislative hearing, where all interested stakeholders are invited to bring their testimonies on the implementation of the Law on...</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Day/Date Time Room</td>
<td>Working Group Coordinator</td>
<td>The Official of the Support organization</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Week VII</th>
<th>Location</th>
<th>The Coordinator of the Committee in cooperation with the Working Group prepares the final report with recommendations which they present to the Committee for review and approval.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Committee support office</td>
<td>Working Group Coordinator</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Week VIII</th>
<th>Location</th>
<th>The Committee during a regular meeting reviews and approves the report and recommends it to the Presidency to review it in the plenary session.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Day/Date Time Room</td>
<td>Committee</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Week IX</th>
<th>Location</th>
<th>With the recommendation of the Committee, the Assembly Presidency places the report with recommendations on the implementation of the Law on... for review in the agenda of the plenary</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Day/Date Time</td>
<td>Assembly Presidency Chari of the Working Group</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Room</td>
<td>Location</td>
<td>Day/Date</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>------</td>
<td>----------</td>
<td>---------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Committee invites the Minister for... to report on the implementation of the recommendations of the report of the oversight of the implementation of the Law on..., approved six months ago in the Assembly.</td>
<td>Committee</td>
<td>Date/Month/Year</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Annex 2 – Identification of obligations that the law foresees for the implementers

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Law on ...</th>
<th>Law no ... for amending and supplementing Law on ...</th>
<th>Obligations that the law foresees for the government, public and private institutions and citizens</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>This Law was promulgated by... [promulgating institution] on... [Date/month/year] and was published in the in the Official Gazette on... [Date/month/year]</td>
<td>This Law was promulgated by decree of the President of Kosovo on... [Date/month/year]</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[The articles of the applicable law are placed on this column]</td>
<td>[The articles of the provisions of the amended and supplemented law are place in this column (if case of these laws)]</td>
<td>[The provisions of the law that represent obligations for the implementers of the law, that will be overseen by the Committee, are placed in this column]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Article1 ...</td>
<td>Article1 ... (amended and supplemented)</td>
<td>What does the Article provide? Who is responsible for its implementation? How much is it being implemented?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Article2 ...</td>
<td>Article2 ... (amended and supplemented)</td>
<td>What does the Article provide? Who is responsible for its implementation? How much is it being implemented?</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| Article ... | Article ... | Questions???

Remark: The identification of issues for oversight and questions posed to the implementers varies depending on the legal provision.
### ASSESSMENT OF COMPLIANCE OF SECONDARY LEGISLATION WITH THE LAW ON...

The list of secondary legislation issued by the institution responsible for the implementation of the Law:

1. Administrative instruction no. xx/xx on...
2. Administrative instruction no. xx/xx on...
3. Rules of procedure of...
4. . . .

### Table for assessing compliance

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Legal provisions that require secondary legislation</th>
<th>Secondary legislation</th>
<th>Assessment of compliance of provisions of secondary legislation with the Law</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>[The legal provisions requiring the issuance of secondary legislation are placed in this column]</td>
<td>If issued by the responsible institution, the name of the secondary legislation is placed in this column</td>
<td>[The secondary legislation is analyzed thoroughly and assessed if it complies with the legal provision or it surpasses the authorizations of the legal provision].</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Article 1 ...</td>
<td>If not issued, it is specified that the issuing institution has not issued the secondary legislation within the deadline as it was required by the law.</td>
<td>[An assessment, remark or comment can be given for each analyzed secondary legislation.]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Article 2 ...</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Article xx ...</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Note: Sample questions on the oversight of the implementation of the Law on the Ministry of Foreign Affairs and Kosovo Diplomatic Service, by the Foreign Affairs Committee of the Assembly of Republic of Kosovo, during a meeting with one of Kosovo’s Ambassadors in a EU country.

Questions for the ambassador:

1. How well are you managing to fulfill your duties and responsibilities as an Ambassador? To which extent are you able to protect Kosovo’s interests in the receiving country? What is the attitude of the host country towards Kosovo (in the politic, economic, social and cultural aspect)? What relations do you have with other embassies in the host country (advantages and disadvantages)?

2. What are the forms and timelines of reporting to the Ministry of Foreign Affairs?

3. What are the operational modalities in your embassy? Where is the embassy located? How many staff members does your embassy have? How satisfied are you with their performance? Do you have sufficient staff?

4. The Ministry has envisaged the issuance subsidiary legislation to regulate the diplomatic ranks of Kosovo’s Diplomatic Service. Article 8, paragraph 2 of the relevant law stipulates: “Diplomatic ranks in international usage of members of the Kosovo Diplomatic Service other than Heads of Mission shall be set out with sub-normative acts of the Ministry.” How are the diplomatic ranks in your Embassy regulated? Are they regulated in conformity with the Law and other legal acts? Further, do you think that the current ranking is in line with the relevant standards and needs of your Embassy?

5. What is the annual budget of the Embassy? How are you managing the budget? Have the Ministry of Foreign Affairs and Ministry of Finance provided adequate legislation for budget management, as stipulated in Article 9 of the Law? Was an audit ever conducted by any institution of the Republic of Kosovo or an External (private) Auditor?
TO: Members of the Assembly  
Cc: Assembly Presidency  
From: Committee on [add title]  
Subject: Report with recommendations on the oversight of the implementation of Law on.... [add title]  
No.:  
Date: Date/Month/Year

Committee on ... [add title of Committee], pursuant to Article 73 of the Assembly Rules of Procedure, oversaw that implementation of Law on ... [add title].

In the meeting held on... [Date/month/year], the Committee decided to present to the Assembly the following:

**Recommendation**

I. The Assembly is advised to adopt the following recommendations:

1. ........ Recommendation 1  
2.......... Recommendation 2  
3.......... Recommendation 3  

II. The reasoning of this report will be presented by Member ______________, Chairman/Vice-Chairman/Rapporteur of the Committee.

Appendices: Oversight of the implementation of Law No....[add name] Report.

Chairman of the Committee  
_________________  
[Name and surname]
IV Legislature
Spring Session

Committee on ...[add name]

Report

Oversight of the implementation of Law No. ... on ... 

Prishtina,.......... 2012
TABLE OF CONTENTS

List of abbreviations

1. Introduction

2. Purpose of the oversight of implementation of Law on ... [add name]

3. Working group composition
   1. Name and surname, rapporteur
   2. Name and surname, member
   3. Name and surname, member
   4. Name and surname, member
   5. Name and surname, member

4. Working group oversight activities on the implementation of the Law
   a. Working group meetings
   b. Field visits
   c. Conduct of oversight hearings
   d. Reporting of responsible persons to the Committee
   e. Reporting in Committee meetings

5. Implementation of Law on ... [add name]
   a. Problems identified in the implementation of the law, based on information requested under Article 73 of the Assembly Rules of Procedure and the main implementation issues.
   b. Conclusion

6. Government responsibility
   (Has the relevant ministry fulfilled all responsibilities towards the Committee, as stipulated in Article 73 of the Assembly Rules of Procedure)

7. Supplementary materials
   a. Documents by the Committee on... [add name]
   b. Reports from field visits
   c. Documents of the Working Group on implementation of the Law

Prishtina, on.......
### Appendix 5: Independent institutions

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No.</th>
<th>Institution</th>
<th>Law regulating the institutional scope</th>
<th>Membership in Steering Boards and their mandate</th>
<th>Reporting to the Assembly and Deadlines</th>
<th>Overseeing Committee</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>People’s Advocate</td>
<td>Law No. 03/L-195 on People’s Advocate</td>
<td>Six months prior to the expiry of the mandate of the Ombudsperson and his five deputies, the respective committee informs the Assembly and initiates proceedings for the selection of the People’s Advocate. Sami Kurteshi was selected Ombudsperson by the Assembly of Kosovo on 4 June 2009. Mr. Kurteshi is not eligible for reappointment. On 4 December 2013, the Assembly must initiate proceedings for the selection of the Ombudsperson and his five deputies. Prior to 4 June 2014, the Assembly shall select the new Ombudsperson and his/her five deputies.</td>
<td>Ombudsperson shall present to the Assembly of Republic of Kosovo an annual report no later than 31 March of the following year. Ombudsperson presents its report in a plenary session. Ombudsperson is eligible to present a special report to the Assembly, thus proposing concrete remedial measures for violated rights.</td>
<td>Committee on Human Rights, Gender Equality, Missing Persons and Petitions.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Office of the Auditor General</td>
<td>Law on the Establishment of the Office of the Auditor General of Kosovo and the Audit Office of Kosovo</td>
<td>The Assembly appoints an Auditor General for a five-year term. Whenever the auditor general remains vacant, the Assembly shall fill the post within 60 days. Until the conclusion of international supervision, the Auditor General is appointed by the ICR. The current Auditor General’s mandate expires in 2013. After this time, it will be up to the Assembly to appoint an Auditor General. The current law does not envisage the procedures for the selection of the Auditor General. Law on Auditor General should be amended and appointment procedures for the Auditor General should be similar to those for the selection of the Ombudsperson or the Director of the Anti-Corruption Agency.</td>
<td>Once per year, within three (3) months from the conclusion of the accounting year, the Auditor General shall submit to the Assembly an annual audit report prepared by the former. This report should contain an independent audit report on the accounts of the Office of the Auditor General of Kosovo. The Auditor General provides a report for the Assembly on the auditing and appropriateness in utilization of the Kosovo Consolidated Budget for each institution and entity, no later than by 31 August of the year following the</td>
<td>Committee on Oversight of Public Finance</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No.</td>
<td>Body</td>
<td>Law</td>
<td>Description</td>
<td>Committee</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-----</td>
<td>-----------------------------</td>
<td>------------------------------------------</td>
<td>-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>---------------------------------</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Central Election Commission</td>
<td>Law No. 03L – 073 on General Elections in Kosovo</td>
<td>CEC comprises eleven (11) members: the Chair and ten members. The Chair is appointed by the President of the Republic of Kosovo and is selected among judges of the Supreme Court. The CEC Chair is elected for a seven (7) year term, commencing on the date determined for the notification of the appointment by the President of Kosovo. CEC Chair shall not serve more than two (2) consecutive terms.</td>
<td>Committee on Legislation</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Central Bank of Kosovo</td>
<td>Law No. 03L-209 on the Central Bank of the Republic of Kosovo</td>
<td>Decision-making bodies of the Central Bank are: Central Bank Board, Executive Board and the Governor. The Central Bank Board comprises the Governor, General Director of the Treasury and three non-executive members. The Executive Board comprises the Governor and Deputy-Governors. The Governor and the non-executive members of the Central Bank Board are appointed for five-year terms.</td>
<td>Committee on Budget and Finance</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
At the request of the Assembly of Kosovo, or at his initiative, the Governor shall at least once per year be heard by the Assembly of the Republic of Kosovo and its committees, in order to be informed on the Central Bank objectives.

**Independent Media Commission**

IMC comprises seven members. At least two members are appointed among non-Albanian community representatives and at least two should be women.

**Election of IMC members**

ICM members are appointed by the Assembly of Kosovo, based on open and transparent procedures.

ICM member candidates are selected based on the following procedures:

- Within sixty days prior to the expiry of the term of a ICM member, or upon vacancy of the post for other reasons, ICM shall issue a public announcement, for a period no shorter than the legally determined deadline;
- Applications received are reviewed by an ad-hoc commission of the Assembly of Kosovo;
- Within twenty-one days after the expiry of the deadline for the presentation of candidacies, and the interviewing of candidates, the ad-hoc commission proposes two members for each vacant ICM member post, based on its findings on the suitability, as per their competencies, professional ability and integrity and their dedication for the scope covered by ICM;
- Pursuant to the Assembly Rules of Procedure, the Assembly selects one of the recommended candidates with the majority of present and voting members.

ICM presents an annual report to the Assembly of Republic of Kosovo no later than 31 March of the following year, which includes complete data on the determination and implementation of broadcasting policies, granting of licenses and appeals and sanctions implemented in relation to such appeals, financial activities, other broadcasting services and objectives for the subsequent year. The annual report shall be made public, upon adoption by the Assembly of Republic of Kosovo.
**Term of ICM members**

The terms of ICM members shall be as follows:

- Two members will be appointed for two-year terms;
- Three members shall be appointed for three-year terms; and
- Two members shall be appointed for four-year terms;

The length of the terms of ICM members shall be determined by a draw.

The term of the ICM Chairman and Deputy-Chairman shall be two-years, with one possibility of reelection.

---

**Anti-corruption Agency**

The Assembly elects the ACA Director for a five-year term;

The current Director of the Agency was elected on 23.09.2011; his mandate expires on 23.9.2016.

Six months prior to the expiry of his term (March 2016), the oversight committee shall inform the Assembly to initiate proceedings for his election.

Hasan Preteni, the current Director of ACA, was elected for his second consecutive term; hence he is no longer eligible for reelection.

The Agency submits the annual work report for the previous year, no later than by 31 March of every calendar year.

The Agency reports each six months to the respective committee. The Law does not stipulate the time for such reports, however, ACA is supposed to report to the Committee. Usually the first report is presented in the first half of the year and the second in the second half.

The committee may request more frequent reports from the agency, at any time the committee finds this necessary.
Through the Government, the Agency submits for the Assembly’s scrutiny and adoption the Anti-Corruption Strategy and Action Plan.

The Anti-Corruption Strategy and Action Plan for 2012-2016 was adopted by the Government (11 Jan 2012), but was not approved by the Assembly of Republic of Kosovo after its review.

### 7. Public Procurement Regulatory Commission

**Law No. 04/L-042 on Public Procurement in the Republic of Kosovo**

PPRC comprises three members. PPRC members are appointed for a five-year term, and may only be reappointed once.

President and members of the PPRC are proposed by the Government and appointed by the Assembly. In the submission of its proposals, the Government shall respect eligibility requirements, specified in paragraph 3 and 4 of this Article.

No person may be proposed, appointed or serve as a member of PPRC in the event that he/she is not eligible to take part in any procurement activity for any of the reasons listed under paragraph 3 of Article 65 of this law. The Government and the Assembly shall ensure that no such person is proposed or appointed member of PPRC.

PPRC shall prepare and submit to the Government and Assembly an annual report which analyzes public procurement activities in Kosovo in a given calendar year, along with the recommendations on improvement of the public procurement system and/or improvement of the said law. The report shall be submitted no later than end of February of following year.

### 8. Procurement Review Body

**Law No. 04/L-042 on Public Procurement in the Republic of Kosovo**

PRB consists of five members of the Board, appointed for five-year terms and eligible for only one reappointment. Administrative support to PRB is given by the Secretariat, led by the Head of the Secretariat.

Members of the PRB appointed previously shall hold their term until its expiry, and may be reelected only if they hold the relevant qualifications as per the applicable law at the time of their appointment. Upon expiry of the initial term, all appointments and PRB, acting through its Chairman, shall provide an annual report for the Assembly of the Republic of Kosovo, no later than end of February, which covers the previous financial year and provides information on procurement activities by type, while distinguishing between appeals against contracting authorities and deliberations of the PPA and PPRC.
reappointments shall be made for five-year terms.

The Chairman and members of PRB are proposed by the Government and appointed by the Assembly, pursuant to the recommendation given by an independent selection body established by the Assembly.

Within thirty days, the Assembly shall review the list and appoint the selected members.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>9</th>
<th>Kosovo Judicial Council</th>
<th>Law No. 03/ L-223 on Kosovo Judicial Council</th>
<th>Kosovo Judicial Council comprises thirteen members, with professional qualifications and expertise. Members are appointed for five-year terms. The Kosovo Judicial Council elects its Chairman and Deputy-Chairman among its members, with a three-year term.</th>
<th>KJC presents, at least once per year, to the Assembly of Kosovo a report on its performance, activities, expenditure and needs of the Kosovo judiciary.</th>
<th>Committee on Legislation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>Kosovo Privatization Agency</td>
<td>Law No. 2011/04-L-034 on Kosovo Privatization Agency</td>
<td>The Agency is governed by its Board of Directors, Managing Director, Two Managing Deputy-Directors, Executive Secretariat Director and professional and technical personnel. KPA competencies are borne by the Board of Directors, comprising eight members (three international and five Kosovar directors). The Chairman, Deputy-Chairman and Director of the Executive Secretariat of the Board, are appointed for one three-year terms, whereas the others are elected for two-year terms, with the right to reelection.</td>
<td>The Board submits to the Assembly of Kosovo the Annual Report of the Agency, which is also made public.</td>
<td>The Committee for Economic Development, Infrastructure, Trade and Industry</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td>Independent Commission for Mines and Minerals</td>
<td>Law No. 03/ L-163 on Mines and Minerals</td>
<td>ICMM is headed by the Board (ICMM Board), which consists of five members. The initial term of ICMM Board members appointed in line with this law, is as follows: one member with a four-year term, two members with three-year terms, Within 90 days from the conclusion of a calendar year, ICMM shall prepare its annual report, publish it in its official website and submit to the Assembly.</td>
<td>Committee on Economic Development, Infrastructure, Trade and Industry</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Civil Aviation Authority of the Republic of Kosovo</strong></td>
<td>Law No. 03/L-09 on Civil Aviation</td>
<td>Activities of the CAA are overseen by a Supervisory Board, which comprises five members. The first members of the Board shall have the following terms: (i) first chairman and another member – two years; and (ii) three other members - four years.</td>
<td>No later than 31 March of every calendar year, the General Director shall prepare, complete and provide the Board, Ministry, Government and Assembly, a comprehensive annual report, which provides detailed information on the previous calendar year.</td>
<td>Committee on Economic Development, Infrastructure, Trade and Industry</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Energy Regulator's Office</strong></td>
<td>Law No. 03/L-85 on Telecommunications</td>
<td>The Energy Regulator's Office is headed by its Board, consisting of five members, including its chairman. The terms of the first board members are: a) 2 years for the chairman; b) 2 years for one member; c) 3 years for one member; d) 4 years for one member; e) 5 years for one member. The term of future members will be five years. Each member of the Board, including the initial members may be reappointed once for one additional five-year term.</td>
<td>The Chairman of the Energy Regulator's Office submits to the Assembly of the Republic of Kosovo an annual report of activities, no later than three months after the end of the calendar year.</td>
<td>Committee on Economic Development, Infrastructure, Trade and Industry</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Telecommunications Regulatory Authority</strong></td>
<td>Law No. 03 / L-90 on Telecommunications</td>
<td>The legal authority of TRA is the TRA Board, which comprises five members. Each member of the regulatory board will serve a five-year term from the moment of appointment. Members shall be eligible for only two terms. In order to ensure that terms of no more than two members shall elapse within the same calendar year, the members of initial members may be postponed.</td>
<td>No later than 6 months after the closure of the fiscal year, TRA shall prepare and submit to the Assembly an annual report containing financial details on activities of TRA for the previous year.</td>
<td>Committee on Economic Development, Infrastructure, Trade and Industry</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No.</td>
<td>Law Name</td>
<td>Description</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-----</td>
<td>----------</td>
<td>-------------</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15</td>
<td>Kosovo Judicial Institute</td>
<td>Law No. 02/L-25 on the Establishment of the Kosovo Judicial Institute. KJI bodies are: Steering Council and Director of KJI. The Steering Council comprises 13 members. 9 members are appointed by the Assembly of Kosovo. Members of the Steering Council are elected for two-year terms, with the right of one reelection. The Director of KJI is elected and dismissed by the Steering Council.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16</td>
<td>Independent Railways Regulatory Authority</td>
<td>Law No. 03/L-076 on Railways in the Republic of Kosovo. All competencies are held by the Board, which comprises four members, including the chairman, vice-chairman and general director. All members of the Board are appointed for terms no shorter than three and no longer than five years. Members of the board may be reappointed for more terms. Railways Regulatory Authority shall: - monitor and provide information to the public, the Assembly and the Ministry of Transport and Communications (the &quot;Ministry&quot;) about the development of the railway sector, related safety issues and the market conditions for railways in Kosovo with a view to introducing competition between Train Operators; - make recommendations to the Assembly and the Ministry with regard to the development of the railway sector, including legislation to promote fair and nondiscriminatory competition and provide the Assembly and the Ministry with all information relevant and necessary to evaluate such recommendations.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17</td>
<td>Kosovo Intelligence Agency</td>
<td>Law no. 03/L-063 on Kosovo Intelligence Agency. KIA Director is responsible for all aspects of KIA management. KIA Director is appointed for a five-year term, and is eligible for one reappointment.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18</td>
<td>Council for Free Legal Aid</td>
<td>Law No. 04/L-017 on Free Legal Aid. The Council comprises seven members, which are elected by the Assembly of Republic of Kosovo, among candidates proposed by the following institutions: The council reports on the functions of the Council to the Assembly of the Republic of Kosovo once per year, and publishes the Report in the Council's official web-page.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Ministry of Justice; Ministry of Labor and Social Welfare; Ministry for Returns and Communities; Ministry of Finances; Kosovo Chamber of Advocates; Supreme Court;

The Council shall announce public invitation for NGO members, wherein from all members it shall select three (3) of them, and then proposes them before the Assembly of the Republic of Kosovo for electing.

Initiation of the procedure for electing the Council's members from the relevant institutions shall be conducted by Council with the request, not later than six (6) months before the expiration of the mandate of the actual members of the Council.

Relevant institutions respond to the Council with the list of the proposed candidates in the timeline of thirty (30) days from the date of receiving of the request from the Council.

The Council shall send the list with the proposed names to the respective commission of the Assembly of Republic of Kosovo for selection of the Council members in the timeline of fifteen (15) days from the day of delivery of the list with proposed persons.

Director and deputy-director are appointed by the Assembly of Kosovo, pending Government recommendations, for a five-year term.

The Steering Board leads the Fund and comprises eight members, one of which has no voting rights. A Selection Committee shall propose candidates to the Assembly for vacancies in the membership or re-appointment of members of the Governing Board.

The Trust shall be required to submit the following information to the Assembly, the CBK and one copy to the Government:
- audited annual account statements of assets and
The Selection Committee shall consist of the Governor of CBK -Chairperson, the Auditor-General and the Minister of Finance. The term of each appointed Governing Board member shall be three (3) years, with the possibility of reappointment, if a Board Members term has expired and no new member has been appointed; then the existing Board Member will continue their mandate for ninety (90) days. International Civilian Representative shall appoint one (1) voting representative as a member of the Governing Board that meets criteria as defined in paragraph 4.4 of this Article, and shall serve concurrently as long as International Civilian Representative remains in Kosovo. Upon departure of the International Civilian Representative member, the Selection Committee shall fill this position as defined in Article 4 of this Law.

The Assembly shall appoint Member(s) of the Governing Board, including the Chairperson, based on the recommendations of the Selection Committee, after consulting the Government. The Government shall submit its opinion to the Assembly within fifteen (15) days from the day it has received the Assembly's request for consultation.

KCC comprises five members. The terms of the initial five KCC members shall be the following: one member is appointed for a one-year term; two members are appointed for three-year terms; and two members are appointed for five-year terms. Their successors shall be appointed for five-year terms. Each calendar year, KCC prepares, publishes and submits to the Assembly an annual report that analyzes competition conditions in Kosovo's general economy and in specific sectors, industries and markets, by aggregating all investigative and executive measures undertaken by the KCC during the respective calendar year.

Such annual reports are submitted to the Assembly no later than February if the following year and published online.
The Board shall be composed of seven (7) members appointed by the Assembly of the Republic of Kosovo on basis of an open and transparent procedure. Chairman of the Council shall be elected among its members. The term of all Council members shall be five years, with one possibility of reelection.

The composition of the Board shall reflect the multi-ethnic and gender character of Kosovo. At least two (2) of its members shall be appointed from among Kosovo non-Albanian community and at least two (2) members shall be among female gender.

Within sixty (60) days before the term of office of the Board member expires or after the launch of a vacancy announcement for other reasons, the Assembly of Kosovo in accordance with rules of procedure shall make a public announcement, within a reasonable time but not later than that established by Law.

Proposed appointments which are duly received shall be considered by an Ad-Hoc Committee of the Assembly of Kosovo.

Within a period of twenty-one (21) days from closing deadline for submission of applications, the Committee, following the interviewing process, shall recommend two (2) applicants for each vacant position to the Board, who are found to be the most suitable on the basis of competence, integrity and their commitment to developing a politically impartial Civil Service in Kosovo that is based on merit and reflects the multiethnic character of Kosovo.

Based on the Rules of Procedure of the Assembly, the Assembly shall appoint one among the applicants recommended for the position on the basis of the majority of votes by the Assembly deputies voting.

The Council submits an annual report to the Assembly of Kosovo. The Council shall submit one copy of the report to the Prime Minister for information purposes.

The report of the Council is made available to the public, upon approval from the Assembly. The report shall be published in the Official Gazette of the Republic of Kosovo.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Agency/Body</th>
<th>Law</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Committee</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>23</td>
<td>National Agency for the Protection of Personal Data</td>
<td>Law No. 03/L-172 on the Protection of Personal Data</td>
<td>The National Supervisor is appointed by the Assembly of Kosovo, at the proposal of the Government of Kosovo, for a five-year term, with possibility of reappointment for one additional term.</td>
<td>Committee on Security, Internal Affairs and KSF</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>24</td>
<td>Radio Television of Kosovo</td>
<td>Law No. 02/L-47 on Radio and Television of Kosovo</td>
<td>The managing body of RTK shall be the RTK Board, comprising 9 members that are appointed by the Assembly of Kosovo.</td>
<td>Committee on Education, Culture, Youth, Sports, Public Administration, Local Governance and Media</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>The term of the President and Vice-president of the RTK Board is two years, with possibility of extension of only one additional term.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>The term of Board members shall be three years.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>A special ad hoc committee of the Assembly, comprising representatives from each political entity represented in the Assembly, shall elect by simple majority one of the candidates for each position, the appointment of which shall be confirmed by a pro forma act of the Assembly.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>The Agency has to submit to the Assembly of Kosovo its annual work report and to publish it no later than 31 March of the following year.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>RTK reports to the Assembly on its financial accounts, on periodic and annual basis and in line with the procedures set in the Law on Public Financial Management and Accountability.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Deadlines</td>
<td>Government</td>
<td>Assembly</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-----------</td>
<td>-----------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>JANUARY</td>
<td>Within thirty (30) days following approval of the Budget and the annual Appropriations Law by the Assembly, the Minister shall prepare and publish in the Official Gazette of Kosovo and on the Ministry’s web-site such budget as well as explanatory documents thereon in a comprehensive and publicly understandable form in the languages required for official documents of the Government.</td>
<td>During the first two months of each fiscal year the Assembly does not have any obligation regarding the review or the approval of the budget, except in cases when the Assembly failed to approve the Appropriations law before 31 December. During this period, the parliamentary committees draft their annual work plans, where they include the review of draft laws, oversight of laws and oversight of the implementation of the budget by the ministries and independent institutions.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MARCH</td>
<td>No later than March 31 of each calendar year, the Minister shall prepare and submit to the Government, for approval and submission to the Assembly, a final budget reconciliation report on the budget for the previous fiscal year and the two prior two fiscal years.</td>
<td>The Committee for Budget and Finances reviews the quarterly report and refers it for discussion in one of the upcoming meetings of the Assembly. The parliamentary committees may discuss the budget of the institutions that they cover and come up with recommendations in the plenary session, when the quarterly report of the budget is discussed.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>APRIL</td>
<td>No later than 30 April, the Government submits to the Assembly the first quarterly report on the budget performance during January – March.</td>
<td>The Committee for Budget and Finances reviews the annual budget report and refers it for discussion in one of the upcoming meetings of the Assembly. The parliamentary committees may discuss the budget of the institutions that they cover and come up with recommendations in the plenary session, when the final report of the budget is discussed.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>JULY</strong></td>
<td>No later than April 30, the Government shall have submitted to the Assembly a Medium Term Expenditure Framework (&quot;MTEF&quot;) covering the next fiscal year and estimates for the two following fiscal years (the “MTEF Budget Period”).</td>
<td>The Assembly reviews the MTEF. The law does not set any deadline when the Assembly should reviews and approve the MTEF.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>The Minister shall issue the budget circular(s) required by paragraph 2 of this Article by April 30 of the current fiscal year.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>SEPTEMBER</strong></td>
<td>No later than 30 July, the Government submits to the Assembly the second quarterly report on the budget performance during March–June.</td>
<td>The Committee for Budget and Finances reviews the semiannual report and refers it for discussion in one of the upcoming meetings of the Assembly. The parliamentary committees may discuss the budget of the institutions that they cover and come up with recommendations in the plenary session, when the semiannual report of the budget is discussed.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>OCTOBER</strong></td>
<td>The date by which municipalities must complete and submit their proposed budgets and appropriations requests shall be September 30 of that year. For budget organizations that are not municipalities, the deadline for submitting such documents shall be as specified in the budget circular.</td>
<td>The Committee for Budget and Finances reviews the nine-month report and refers it for discussion in one of the upcoming meetings of the Assembly. The parliamentary committees may discuss the budget of the institutions that they cover and come up with recommendations in the plenary session, when the nine-month report of the budget is discussed.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Once the Government has approved a proposed Kosovo Budget and a proposed Appropriations Law, the Government shall submit such documents to the Assembly no later than October 31 of the then current fiscal year.

The Assembly has two months to review and adopt the draft budget for the coming fiscal year.

If the Assembly fails to approve the Budget before 31 December, the Assembly should make the decision to extend the applicability of the law of the previous fiscal year, but not for more than three months.
Annex 8: Strategies and Action Plans adopted during the years, the applicability of which includes 2012 and following years

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No</th>
<th>Name</th>
<th>Adopted by</th>
<th>Responsible Ministry</th>
<th>Functional Committee</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Strategic plan for Residential Accommodation of the Government of Kosovo</td>
<td>27.2.2008</td>
<td>Ministry of Public Administration (MPA)</td>
<td>Committee for Education, Culture, Youth, Sports, Diaspora, Public Administration, Local Government and Media (Short: Committee for Education).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Strategy for Integration of Roma, Ashkali and Egyptian Communities in the Republic of Kosovo 2009 - 2015 and Action Plan</td>
<td>24.12.2008</td>
<td>Ministry for Communities and Return (MCR)</td>
<td>Committee on Rights, Interests of Communities and Returns (short: Committee for Communities)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(The Action Plan was approved on 23.12.'09)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Medium term work strategy of MLGA 2009-2012</td>
<td>30.1.2009</td>
<td>Ministry of Local Government Administration (MLGA)</td>
<td>Committee for Education</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>National Strategy of the Republic of Kosovo for Integrated Border Management and Action Plan for this strategy</td>
<td>08.4.2009</td>
<td>MIA Ministry of Finance (MF) Food and Veterinary Agency (FVA)</td>
<td>Committee on Internal Affairs, Security and Supervision of the Kosovo Security Force (Short: Committee on Security)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Committee on Health, Labor and Social Welfare</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No.</td>
<td>Title</td>
<td>Date</td>
<td>Responsible Authority</td>
<td>Committee/Ministry</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-----</td>
<td>----------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>-------</td>
<td>-----------------------</td>
<td>------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>National Strategy of the Republic of Kosovo Against Drugs and Action Plan</td>
<td>19.6.2009</td>
<td>MIA, MF, Ministry of Health (MH), KIA</td>
<td>Committee on Security, Committee on Health</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td>Strategic Development Plan 2009-2013 of the Statistical Office of Kosovo</td>
<td>10.8.2009</td>
<td>MPA</td>
<td>Committee for Education</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16</td>
<td>Multimodal Transport Strategy and Action Plan</td>
<td>13.11.2009</td>
<td>Ministry for Infrastructure</td>
<td>Committee for Economic Development</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17</td>
<td>Kosovo Youth Strategy and Action Plan 2010 - 2012</td>
<td>13.11.2009</td>
<td>Ministry for Culture, Youth and Sport (MCYS)</td>
<td>Committee for Education</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20</td>
<td>Strategic Development Plan 2009-2013 of the Ministry of Public Administration</td>
<td>9.1.2010</td>
<td>MPA</td>
<td>Committee for Education</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>21</td>
<td>Strategic Development Plan 2009-2013 of</td>
<td>22.1.2010</td>
<td>MIA</td>
<td>Committee on Security</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No.</td>
<td>Document Title</td>
<td>Date</td>
<td>Responsible Bodies</td>
<td>Committee for</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-----</td>
<td>-------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>------------</td>
<td>--------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>---------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>22</td>
<td>Strategy for Communities and Returns 2009-2013</td>
<td>12.2.2010</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>MCR</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>24</td>
<td>Strategy for Health Promotion Schools in Kosovo 2009-2018</td>
<td>30.3.2010</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>MEST, MH, MESP, MCYS</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Committee for Education Committee on Health Committee for Agriculture</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>25</td>
<td>Amendment and supplement of the Strategy on Repatriation of Repatriated Persons and Action Plan of the Strategy for reintegration of repatriated persons</td>
<td>26.5.2010</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>MIA, MF</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Committee on Security</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Committee for Economic Development</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Committee on Security</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>28</td>
<td>Strategy for the Development of Metrology Infrastructure in Kosovo 2010 - 2014</td>
<td>23.6.2010</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>MTI</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Committee for Economic Development</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>29</td>
<td>Strategic Development Plan for the Ministry of Local Government for the period 2009 - 2013</td>
<td>15.9.2010</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>MLGA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Committee for Education</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>30</td>
<td>Strategic Development Plan for Kosovo Institute for Public Administration for the period 2010 - 2014</td>
<td>29.9.2010</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>MPA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Committee for Education</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>31</td>
<td>Strategy for Achieving Full International Recognition of the Republic of Kosovo</td>
<td>8.6.2011</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>MFA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Committee on Foreign Affairs</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>32</td>
<td>Land Consolidation Strategy for 2010-2020</td>
<td>29.6.2011</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>MAFRD</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Committee for Agriculture</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>33</td>
<td>Strategy for Integrated Conservation in Kosovo</td>
<td>29.6.2011</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>MCYS</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Committee for Education</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No.</td>
<td>Title</td>
<td>Date</td>
<td>Ref.</td>
<td>Committee</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-----</td>
<td>----------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>------------</td>
<td>------</td>
<td>-----------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>36</td>
<td>Strategy and Action Plan for Biodiversity</td>
<td>20.7.2011</td>
<td>MAFRD</td>
<td>Committee for Agriculture</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>37</td>
<td>Strategic Development Plan of the Ministry of Environment and Spatial Planning 2011-2014</td>
<td>27.7.2011</td>
<td>MESP</td>
<td>Committee for Agriculture</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>38</td>
<td>Strategic Development Plan of the Ministry for Communities and Returns 2011-2013</td>
<td>10.8.2011</td>
<td>MCR</td>
<td>Committee for Communities</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>39</td>
<td>Education Strategy 2011-2016</td>
<td>25.8.2011</td>
<td>MEST</td>
<td>Committee for Education</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>42</td>
<td>National Strategy and Action Plan against Trafficking in Human Beings</td>
<td>01.09.2011</td>
<td>MIA</td>
<td>Committee on Security</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>44</td>
<td>The strategy of the Kosovo Security Force</td>
<td>19.10.2011</td>
<td>Ministry of Security Force</td>
<td>Committee on Security</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>45</td>
<td>Mining Strategy of the Republic of Kosovo for the period 2012 - 2025</td>
<td>16.11.2011</td>
<td>MED</td>
<td>Committee for Economic Development</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Current under review in Assembly**
Publication of this manual is facilitated by the United States Agency for International Development (USAID) and the National Democratic Institute (NDI)